




University of
Stavanger

FACULTY OF ARTS AND EDUCATION

MASTER'S THESIS

Programme of study: JMMIR – Joint Master in Migration and Intercultural Relations	4 th semester, 2012 Open
Author: Benjamin Waldejer	 (Author's signature)
Supervisor: Claudia Morsut (UIS)	
Thesis title: Local Implications of a Globalised Prostitution market	
Keywords: Migration, Prostitution, Trafficking, Globalisation, Discourse, Stavanger	No. of pages: 63 + Appendices/other: 67 Stavanger, 10.12.2012

Local Implications of a Globalised Prostitution Market

Joint Master in Migration and Intercultural Relations

Master Thesis

By

Benjamin Waldejer

Fall of 2012

Contents

Introduction.....	4
1. Framework.....	7
The Research Framework.....	8
Relevant Theories and Concepts.....	13
Factors in Analysing Networks	14
2. Conceptualising the Global	17
Transnationalism.....	21
Theories on International Migration.....	23
Globalisation and Migration Theory	25
3. The Marketplace.....	28
The Outdoor Market.....	29
Discourse.....	33
The Indoor-Market.....	38
4. Sex as Liberation or Exploitation?.....	40
Approaches to Prostitution and Trafficking.....	42
Empirical Studies in Norway.....	44
State Dilemmas.....	46
The Securitisation of Migration.....	47
5. Global markets.....	50
Mobility and Migration Patterns	50
The Global Marketplace.....	51
Final Discussions.....	55
6. Conclusion	61
Bibliography.....	65

Introduction

When I started the work with this thesis I had great ideas of what would come of it. I imagined finding great breakthroughs in empirical material and plenty of “unknowns” that would be uncovered. I chose to look at street-prostitution in my home town of Stavanger. Street-prostitution in Stavanger had not really increased significantly in total, but there was much reaction to what was seen as overtly visible, intrusive and different in the new developments in the streets. Nigerian women had entered into the local market.

I thought long and hard about how to gain access to new first-hand sources. First-hand sources in this case meant talking to the women who were working the streets.

After short time I found a local NGO that worked to help the women who were involved in street prostitution. When I started working with them I quickly realised how big the challenges were to actually getting access to first-hand information. The first and most obvious hindrance to actually getting information was that few if any of the women were willing to talk about their situations. Conversations about daily life or family were commonplace but digging any deeper would often instantly turn the person away. There were however some who were willing to go into the politics and practical reality of what was actually going on. At first I thought I had hit the academic jackpot, new sources untouched by other researchers willing to talk about the bigger picture. However after giving it more thought the sad reality of what could happen became more clear. Despite the attention they raise in the media, the women who work the streets of Stavanger are not more than that they quite clearly know who the others on the streets are. Furthermore it was not possible to arrange interviews without drawing attention to the informant from others in the streets and probably people behind the scenes. Although there are many more issues relating to the information that did arise from the more tentative conversations, they will be dealt with later in the thesis. However it is important to underline from the very start of this thesis that getting to the details from individuals on the streets would regardless of intention place the informants at great risk. There is great reason to believe that many of the women, if not all, have at some point in their lives been victims of trafficking for the purposes of sexual exploitation. There is also great reason to believe that many of the women are currently in debt-bondage, meaning that they are by various means bound to work off their debts to their traffickers.

Although it might seem easy to get information from a first-hand source, the risk it would place on the informant is not ethically defensible. The informants in question have either by force, coercion

or voluntarily become removed from their families and friends by thousands of kilometres to work the streets in Norway, hours on end catering to the drunk and lonely even through the worst of Norwegian weather. It seems both unfair and cruel to place them in risk of further problems. This conclusion was difficult to come to because it also meant the failure of this project to result in any significant new empirical material, which had been the goal of this project. However, I have come to realise that no result is a result in itself. And despite the failure to gain first-hand sources, the experience of observing in the field and discussing with those who work with aiding the women on the streets has resulted in quite a lot of material. The current form of this thesis is based on this material. It is not the thesis I intended it to be, but then again, sound research should never be predetermined either.

According to the most recent statistics from ILO there are today more than 21 million people that endure slavery in the world.¹ Although statistics like this are useful to illustrate the extent of the problem, it is a typical example of the “estimation regime” that dominates the literature on the topic of trafficking in the modern era. The vast majority of figures that appear in the literature are estimations, often made on dubious grounds. Moreover, the “guestimation game” is constantly played whenever anyone attempts to make statistics on the topic. According to some researchers the entire field of research on trafficking suffers from sweeping generalisations.²

The work of this thesis is a reaction to this dominant trend in the literature on trafficking, and in contrast to most literature on the topic I will abstain as far as possible from making statistical assessments for the purpose of solidifying the argumentation in this thesis.

As mentioned above, the work leading to the material of this thesis has been a process of realisation into the difficulties of empirical studies in the greyer areas of society. However, this thesis has turned out to be a work of three complementing parts. The first of which deals with the theoretical work on international migration and globalisation, secondly this thesis looks into the workings of local prostitution market of Stavanger, and finally it combines a look at the perceptions and discourses that dominate the local debate. It is the opinion of the author that connecting theoretical work, observations in the field and the reactions of local communities that we can begin to comprehensively understand the connections between migration, prostitution and trafficking. This thesis also attempts to contribute in bridging the gap between theoretical and empirical work

1 International Labour Office - Special Action Programme to Combat Forced Labour (SAP-FL), *ILO Global Estimate of Forced Labour - Results and Methodology* (Geneva: ILO, 2012).

2 Laura María, Agustín, *Sex at the Margins: Migration, Labour Markets and the Rescue Industry* (London: Zed Books, 2007), 38.

within the field of migration studies.

This thesis consist of 6 chapters where the final chapter is a conclusion of the thesis.

In chapter 1 I will lay out the framework for the thesis, including the research question, methodology and discussion of terminology and factors for analyses.

In chapter 2 I will focus on theory and how the concept of globalisation is to be understood in connection to the research question. Theories and concepts on international migration are also a significant part of this chapter. In chapter 3 I will look into the local case of prostitution in Stavanger and present findings from my own observations. In chapter 4 I will discuss epistemic approaches to prostitution and trafficking along with drawing a parallel to the growing trend of securitization. Finally, in chapter 5 I will present the final discussion of the thesis and connect theory to empirical findings.

1. Framework

Prostitution has become a significant part of international migration processes. Although often thought of as the study of people living on the margins of society, modern age prostitution is highly complex. Some people argue that the modern-age, 'internet-booked', sex-worker is liberated and autonomous. Others again dismiss this as a falsification of a reality where people are being severely exploited.

It is very difficult to generalise on this topic because both arguments are valid, at the same time it is a topic where practical realities are constantly in a state of transformation. Many people are exploited and suffer at great length working as prostitutes. Others become economically autonomous and are able to significantly accumulate wealth. Thousands of people are trafficked each year for exploitation on the global prostitution market. Yet, far from all people working in prostitution are victims of this kind of crime. The forced and the willing, the exploited and the independent, the 'needy and the greedy' can all be said to be parts of the contemporary sex-industry. This industry, like other major industries, is a part of a global economic market. Social, political and economic factors in countries all around the globe now influence developments in the global sex-industry. Like any other market in Norway, the prostitution market has become globalised. As in any other modern market, information and communication technologies play an increasingly crucial role. But more importantly, the migration of people now plays such an important role that we might even describe it as the key common denominator in Norwegian prostitution. The aim of this thesis is to illustrate how migration has become the key component of prostitution markets in the modern age, for better or for worse. It involves criminal trafficking networks as well as legal and pseudo-legal transnational networks. In this thesis I will use the Norwegian city of Stavanger to illustrate how prostitution has become a globalised issue. I intend to investigate this topic from the perspective of migration. In this first chapter I will lay out the research framework for this thesis before moving on to discuss some of the key factors in analysing transnational networks. But before looking into the research framework it is important to have some background information on the main focus of this thesis; the case of Stavanger.

Backdrop

Over the past decade there has been a significant change to the composition and character of the Norwegian prostitution market. These changes have introduced new social phenomena that

challenge social norms, political and legal institutions as well as law-enforcement agencies.

Attention ranging from national to local press coverage, spanning many hundreds of articles, has been given to the issues that relate to transnational prostitution in contemporary Norway. The market has significantly changed both in street- and indoor-prostitution during the past decade. It is currently comprised of many sets of complex global and regional networks.

It is first and foremost the global and regional origin of the service-providers, that defines the prostitution market in the case of Stavanger. That is the major difference from previous times where the majority composition of the service providers were ethnic Norwegians. There is a two dimensional prostitution-market in Stavanger. The *outdoor* market is represented almost exclusively by Nigerian women, whilst the *indoor* market is comprised of people from many different countries around the globe. During the past few years the most intense media and political attention has been given to the Nigerian women in the outdoor market. In January 2009, the purchasing of sexual services was made illegal in Norway. It is a decidedly progressive law in that it does not merely ban the purchasing of sexual services in Norwegian jurisdiction, it has made it illegal for any Norwegian citizen to do so anywhere on the planet. This law was inspired by a similar law introduced only a few years earlier in Sweden. It is, however, more correct to connect this law to the influx of Nigerian women on the outdoor-markets of Norway and the following public reactions, than to claim it was a result of ideological inspiration from Swedish MPs. This legal dimension is merely one among many fiercely debated-topics which are related to contemporary prostitution in Norway. Before we go any further it is important to ask; what angle should we follow if we are to investigate this topic from the perspective of migration?

The Research Framework

The main research questions in this thesis is; what are the key concepts and problems in the study of trafficking and transnational prostitution in Stavanger? In other words, what are the local implications of a globalised prostitution market?

This master thesis aims at exploring the phenomena of human trafficking and prostitution as a migration issue, and will therefore be discussing many of the broader perspectives on transnational networks and migration flows and patterns.

This thesis draws a particular focus to street prostitution among Nigerian immigrant women in Europe. I will argue that Nigerian women working in prostitution in Stavanger, like many other places in Europe, are parts of loosely organised but strongly binding sets of trafficking networks. Deception, fraud, debt-bondage, exploitation along with threats of or use of violence can be found

in these networks in Stavanger like in many other European cities. It is an aim of this thesis to look into the migration perspective of this kind of network in order to get to the bigger picture of why so many Nigerian women end up leading a life of prostitution and economic bondage in Europe. It is also the focus of this thesis to illustrate how important globalisation processes, particularly the informational and communication transformations, have been in facilitating this kind of transnational network activity.

Methodology

The research for this thesis has been based on three different parts. Firstly, I conducted observational fieldwork by working with the local NGO, *Albertine Prosjektet*, in Stavanger. By working with this organisation I was able to observe and speak to the women in the outdoor market on numerous occasions spanning a period of more than 18 months. I chose not to attempt the traditional in-depth style of interviews for a number of different reasons, primarily because of critical issues related to the anonymity and protection of sources. The prostitution market in Stavanger is large in relation to the size of the city. But it is still small enough for it to be evident who has spoken out about what. Therefore I have based this part of the research on observations and interaction in the field.

The second part of the research has been based on conversational interviews with the employees of *Albertine Prosjektet*. The employees of this organisation have been working with the local prostitution market for a number of years and have extensive knowledge about its workings which are important to include.

The third part of the research for this thesis has been conducting a critical discourse analysis of local and national media coverage, particularly focusing on the two main newspapers in Stavanger; *Stavanger Aftenblad* and *Rogalandsavis*. These two newspapers are the main outlets for local discourses in Stavanger, and they play a decisive role in the construction of political and public discourse on prostitution in Stavanger. These discourses play a crucial role in how the local community reacts, and therefore it is an integral part of understanding the social implications of prostitution in Stavanger.

In the next section I will discuss the three most important terms that will be used in this thesis, starting with the term 'trafficking'.

Terminology

There are many terms which need to be clarified in order to establish a framework of terms for this analysis. Many of the terms appear at first to be self-evident, however, it is striking how often the

terms 'trafficking', 'prostitution', 'sex-work' and 'victim' are defined differently in literature on this topic.

In defining what trafficking is, most scholars use the definition in the *United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime and the Protocols Thereto* of 2004. The short version of this definition states:

“Human trafficking is the acquisition of people by improper means such as force, fraud or deception, with the aim of exploiting them”³

The UN definition clearly underlines that exploitation, violence or the threat of violence, deception, fraud and abduction is at the core of the term. This is what sets human trafficking aside from human smuggling. Human trafficking is often misunderstood to mean human smuggling and it is important to understand that although smuggling is involved in many cases of trafficking, it is not a demarcation of trafficking by itself. Smuggling refers commonly to illicit transport of people or materials across international borders. In some cases of trafficking, smuggling is a necessary component yet in other cases there is no need to physically smuggle people across borders. This can be due to legal status, or because of acquisition of travel-documentation which enables international travels. This type of trafficking where international travel is made possible by legal or pseudo-legal means (i.e. forged documentation or acquisition by bribery) is the most prevalent form of trafficking in the cases which this thesis focuses on.

'Prostitution' or 'sex-work'?

'Prostitution' is a heavily debated term, at the same time it is the most commonly used noun for describing the kind of work or provider in the sale of physical sexual contact. Wide definitions, that define prostitution as one party providing sexual contact in exchange for a form of payment from another, easily lead to highly problematic discourses. Firstly, this description of prostitution could be used to describe relatively common aspects in the daily lives of virtually all couples, where one party does something for the other and in return is awarded sexual contact. Similarly, one could say that marriage in many traditional senses resembles the wide definition of prostitution. One party provides for the couple financially and in return receives emotional and physical care from the other. Yet, in some cases marriage is publicly defined as a form of prostitution. The 'mail-order-bride' is not the only form of marriage described in such terms. At present there are many different companies in south-east Asia which work to find spouses predominantly for western male

³ United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, “United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime and the Protocols Thereto” (UN, New York 2004), 42–44.

customers.⁴ In these cases it is not always far-fetched to draw a connection between marriage and prostitution. Furthermore, combined with immigration legislation in destination countries, this type of marriage can constitute direct sexual exploitation and bondage.⁵ It is important to note that describing marriages as a form of prostitution is a very risky discourse at best, firstly because it highly stigmatises many couples and secondly there are most often many more factors involved than living standards and sex.

The wide definition of 'prostitution' does not appear to be particularly useful for an analysis, not merely because it is diffuse, but also there is undeniably a very big difference between providing something in return for sex from one partner or spouse and selling sexual services in a market economy with large numbers of different customers.

In recent years the terminology of 'prostitution' has increasingly come under fire both from academics and from the service providers themselves. Laura Agustín, author of the book *Sex at the Margins; Migration, Labour Markets and the Rescue industry*, is a proponent of the view that the terminology of 'prostitution' perpetuates a constructed sub-class of people which is subject to the paternalistic authority of people on the outside.⁶ Agustín instead focuses on the terminology of 'sex-work' or 'sex-labour' following the example of the "sex-workers in Europe manifesto".⁷ Here 'sex-work' is seen as a regular service occupation in the market economy.⁸ The problem, however, with this terminology is that it significantly increases the scope compared to the term 'prostitution'. This is because very many forms of work which are not currently considered as 'prostitution' fall into the category of 'sex-work'.

There is yet another term which is often used interchangeably with prostitution and sex-work. The term 'sex for survival' or 'survival sex' was initially used to describe adolescent prostitution in the US and Canada, where a significant proportion of young people sell sexual services in order to get shelter, food, clothes or drugs.⁹ In other words, selling sex for necessities that would help them to survive. This term was originally used in relation to adolescents, however, it is also a fitting term for

4 Catey Sexton, "Looking for Love," *Louis Theroux's Weird Weekends* (BBC, October 23, 2000).

5 Here is an example that illustrates the precarious type of scenario which can occur. If a citizen from outside the EU is to marry a Norwegian citizen, this person must live a minimum of three years married in Norway in order to achieve permanent residence. If the said Norwegian in this couple decides to get a divorce before these three years have passed then the other party must leave the country. Given that Norway has a very high standard of living, there may well occur a situation where the spouse of the Norwegian citizen is living totally at the mercy of the Norwegian in order to sustain the increased living standard. Needless to say, this is very far from the average marriage between Norwegians and non-EU citizens, however it does illustrate that there are legal structures which can force people into a situation of bound exploitation beyond the reaches of law.

6 Agustín, (2007), 7–8.

7 "Sex Workers in Europe Manifesto" (The European Conference on Sex Work, Human Rights, Labour and Migration, Brussels, Belgium, 2005)

8 Agustín, (2007) 72.

9 W. Pedersen and K. Hegna, "Children and adolescents who sell sex: a community study* 1," *Social Science & Medicine* 56, no. 1 (2003), 136.

other vulnerable groups involved in prostitution. Not only adolescents sell sex for subsistence. Despite the arguments of the proponents of the term 'sex-work', it does not at all seem to be an easier term to employ than the term 'prostitution'. The terminology of 'sex-work' includes not only the sale of physical sexual services but also includes stripping, phone-sex, pornography etc. and becomes a rather diffuse definition.

It does not seem possible to create a purely descriptive terminology that will encompass all the forms which the sale of sexual contact may take. Even among the service providers there is no label or 'identity' which is universally accepted.¹⁰ In this thesis I will refer to 'sex-work' as a wider definition including both contact- and non-contact sexual work, while I will refer to 'prostitution' as the sale of physical sexual contact in the market economy. In the latter term I will include the concept of 'sex for survival' as a part of the sale of physical sexual contact in the market economy.

'Victim'

The use of the term 'victim', although mostly well-intended, has many negative implications which may not seem evident at first. In relation to prostitution, certain discourses have become the master-narratives that are widely held among social agents. In *Sex Slaves and Discourse Masters: The Construction of Trafficking*, Jo Doezema argues that dominant discourses on trafficking and prostitution in Britain have followed the 'victim/whore' dichotomy that marks "...the dividing line between those deserving of rescue and those deserving condemnation."¹¹

The typical problem with victimisation is that individuals or groups may be rendered disempowered by use of paternalistic policies or actions by social agents. Effectively, the social agents (i.e. institutions and authorities) designate for the "victims" what is for their own good. In practical terms, this means that the will and opinions of people or groups become entirely side-tracked by social authorities that argue they 'know best, what is for the best'. This topic is a recurring theme throughout Doezema's *Sex Slaves and Discourse Masters* where remnants of Victorian age morals are seen to play a fundamental role in the construction of the victim/whore dichotomy. Doezema illustrates how the 'myth of the white slave' and the 'willing whore' serves to perpetuate the moralisations in the dominant discourses of British society.¹²

Agustin also makes a strong case in her argument that victimisation of prostitutes mainly serves the purposes of a paternalistic rescue industry that exists on the premisses of their own narratives.¹³

Maggy Lee, an influential writer on the topic, has a very interesting passage on the 'ideal victim' in

¹⁰Ibid., 72–73.

¹¹Jo. Doezema, *Sex slaves and discourse masters : the construction of trafficking* (London; New York: Zed Books ; 2010), 13.

¹²Doezema, *Sex slaves and discourse masters : the construction of trafficking*.

¹³Agustín, (2007)

the book *Trafficking and Global Crime Control*, where she illustrates how the 'ideal victim'-typology is constructed and the social importance it is given. According to Lee, traditional 'victim-offender' typologies renders the 'ideal victim' as passive and as someone who has had no say in events leading to their situation. The major problem here is that those who do not fit into this pattern become invisible and lose out on public support. The really serious problem arises in legal systems where the character and history of the 'victims' is given importance in deciding if they are 'innocent' or 'culpable'.¹⁴ As Lee writes,

It forms part of what Loseke calls the 'cultural feeling rules surrounding sympathy' that require victims to be 'people in *higher moral categories*' and 'not responsible' for their suffering (1999:76)¹⁵

As for the cases discussed in this thesis there is a particular focus on the trafficked 'victim', however, in the following chapters I will illustrate not only how the 'victims' rarely fit the 'ideal victim'-typology, but also how this typology plays an important part in the dominant discourses of Norwegian society. I will argue that these discourses are detrimental to creating a solution to trafficking in Europe. Far from all people working in prostitution are 'victims', and far from all 'victims' of trafficking consider themselves as 'victims'.

Relevant Theories and Concepts

There are many relevant concepts and theories which may be drawn into the discussion of prostitution and trafficking. The most important theories for this thesis are theories on international migration, particularly those that draw on the larger global perspectives. This is because the issues at hand are globally relevant. Although globalisation itself is not a theory but an ongoing process, there are many theories on globalisation which are integral to understanding international migration in the contemporary.

But why specifically is globalisation, or better put, why are globalisation processes relevant to looking at the prostitution market of a small European town like Stavanger?

A simple answer to this question is that without the modes of communication and transportation resulting from the transformations of globalisation processes, the prostitution market in Stavanger would not display the current global composition. But this argument is not merely a contra-factual negation, it is also far too simple. The main reason for using the concept of globalisation is that it

¹⁴Maggy. Lee, *Trafficking and global crime control* (London; Thousand Oaks, Sage, 2011), 64–67.

¹⁵Ibid., 66.

illustrates processes at the macro-levels of migration.

Another concept which is highly relevant both to theories on globalisation and international migration is the concept of transnationalism and transnational space. This concept offers a perspective which focuses more on the micro- and meso- levels of migrant activity. The interconnection of people and the compression of time and space in the modern age allows relations between people to transcend concepts of nationality and ethnic identity. The establishment of interconnected communities across states and regions is driven by individual migrants keeping old relations and building new across national boundaries. Transnationalism as a perspective leans heavily on historical and sociological research, where individuals and their social networks are the key issues. There are many critical elements with theories on globalisation and transnationalism that I will expand on in Chapter 2, along with several theories on international migration.

Factors in Analysing Networks

In the book *Trafficking in humans : social, cultural and political dimensions*, Cameron and Sally explain that what makes trafficking such a complex phenomenon to analyse is the wide range of factors which intersect. In their analysis they argue that it is necessary to comprehensively analyse all the factors and perspectives in order to understand this complexity. As they write:

Broadly speaking, these factors can be divided into two categories: structural and proximate. Structural factors include issues of economic deprivation and market downturns, the effects of globalization, attitudes to gender, the demand for prostitutes and situations of conflict. Proximate factors include lax national and international legal regimes, poor law enforcement, corruption, organized criminal entrepreneurship and weak education campaigns. An understanding of this structural context is vital for addressing the problem at both the site of origin and the destination, as well as at the international level. Any assessment of the dynamics of the trafficking business, as well as existing and possible remedial efforts, must be made in this comprehensive context.¹⁶

The main advantage of this framework of analysis is that it focuses on both the origin and destination as well as on the international level. Many studies of trafficking focus exclusively on the destination area, and thereby overlook the key factors in why trafficking networks and flows become established. It is my opinion that a greater focus on the area of origin is vital, especially with regards to legal responses to trafficking put forth by states. As I will illustrate later in this thesis, trafficking flows have a tendency to change destinations depending on the various developments within proximate factors. Therefore any study of trafficking flows will fail to create

¹⁶Sally Cameron and Edward Newman, *Trafficking in humans : social, cultural and political dimensions* (Tokyo; New York: United Nations University Press, 2008), 21.

comprehensive perspectives unless the origin of trafficking flows are taken into account. In the present situation of a highly interconnected Europe, hindrances to the network activities are simply met by changes in destination. In many ways one could say that trafficking networks are risk assessing. The assessment of risk in relation to profitability define the destinations. These changes are rapid and fluctuating. When the law prohibiting the purchase of sexual services was introduced in 2009, there was a significant fall in street-prostitution in Norway during the first few months after the introduction. Within 6 months of the introduction of this law, aid-organizations and NGO's could report that street-prostitution was back to the same levels as before the introduction of the law. Although, many have argued that there was an initial success in hindering the trafficking of people to Norway for purposes of street-prostitution, it is worth questioning what kind of 'success' this really was. Were trafficking flows significantly hindered by this new legislation, and did the Norwegian government prevent people from being trafficked by introducing this law?

With regards to the trafficking flows from outside of Europe, it is beyond reasonable doubt to say the answer is no. Trafficking flows continued exactly as before, the only difference was that the final destination within Europe was changed. But even if this law had been an enduring 'success' in Norway, the scope of this 'successful' fight against trafficking would nevertheless be limited to national boundaries. In essence it simply shifted the problem over to other European states.

Similarly, if European countries somehow should manage to completely hinder trafficking of people to Europe, is it reasonable to think these flows will simply stop and not go elsewhere instead?

Again, the most likely answer is no. Furthermore, other destinations may be of much lower social and economic standard than that of the European countries, thereby actually worsening the conditions for future victims of trafficking. Factors in destination areas are not the only keys to understanding trafficking flows. Making changes in destination areas may ultimately worsen the situation of victims of trafficking. Although, factors in destination areas are important to understanding how trafficking networks operate and under which conditions they operate. However, any discussion of causal relations must look into factors in the countries of origin.

Transnational networks

Similar to trafficking, factors in analysing transnational networks are many and intersecting. Factors in the countries of origin and destination interplay and are constantly in a state of transformation. It must be said that it is difficult to analyse a phenomenon that appears to be constantly changing. Political, social, economic and legal circumstances combine to set the premisses of transnational network activity.

But, there are certain factors that are more crucial than others. In this thesis I have chosen to focus

on what facilitates transnational network activity. The focus is not merely on who enables the connections between people, but also on political developments that have allowed transnational networks to flourish. An example of this kind of political development is the establishment of the Schengen free economic zone in Europe. The main advantage of focusing on the facilitators of transnational networks, is that it allows for greater accuracy in describing causal relations. Furthermore, both in regards to transnational networks and trafficking networks, economics and wage-differentials are highly significant in determining the destination.

In order to understand how international migration and prostitution intersect there are three key elements which need to be explored. Firstly, globalization processes and their relevance to international migration. Secondly, transnationalism and how transnational networks emerge. Finally, theories on international migration and how they relate to the case of prostitution in Stavanger. In the following chapter I will expand on these three elements which are crucial determinants for the development of the prostitution market in Stavanger.

2. Conceptualising the Global

One would have thought that, with the immense improvements in the understanding of human nature and the environment, any form of exploitation that looks like slavery would be abhorred automatically. Alas! This is not the case, as human beings are today, prized as commodities and exchanged for money like any other article in the market.¹⁷

Osita Agbu, "Corruption and Human Trafficking: The Nigerian case"

Today people are commodities on the global market, be it by means of legal labour migrations or illegal trafficking. Due to globalisation processes which span several hundred years back in history, people are now commodities that are bought, sold and rented on the global economic market. It is important to understand that globalisation and commodification of global labour markets is by no means a new phenomenon or epochal turn.¹⁸ Some argue that these modern processes of global transformation dates back many centuries. The historian Immanuel Wallerstein argues through extensive empirical studies that the modern world economic system dates back at least to the 16th century. Furthermore, Wallerstein shows how the expansion of the world economic system always was closely linked to migration.¹⁹ In order to comprehensively understand the connection between prostitution, trafficking and migration we must look into the circumstantial premise of ongoing globalisation processes. How do we explain globalisation in connection to the migration-prostitution-trafficking nexus?

In the contemporary there are many perspectives one might take on explaining globalisation processes. According to the sociologists Martin Shaw there is a tendency to reduce globalisation to technical changes, particularly in communications technology. Shaw argues that social and political contents are neglected and seen as consequences or implications of the core globalising processes.²⁰ In the book *Globalization, a critical introduction*, Jan Aart Scholte argues that globalisation best can be seen as a process of growing transplanetary connectivity. Scholte argues that globalisation is such an immensely complex process that it cannot be explained by a simple theory or approach.²¹

17O. Agbu, "Corruption and human trafficking: The Nigerian case," *West Africa Review* 4, no. 1 (2003): 1.

18Andreas Wimmer and Nina Glick Schiller, "Methodological Nationalism, the Social Sciences, and the Study of Migrations," *International Migration Review* 37, no. 3 (Fall 2003): 596.

19Immanuel Wallerstein, *The modern world-system. 1: Capitalist agriculture and the origins of the European world-economy in the sixteenth century*. (New York: Academic Press, 1974).

20Martin Shaw, "Globality and Historical Sociology," in *Historical sociology of international relations*, ed. Stephen Hobden and John M. Hobson (Cambridge, UK; New York: Cambridge University Press, 2002), 85.

21Ibid., 59–76, 152–154.

In the book *The Informational City*, Manuel Castells presents globalisation as the transformation of society from the 'space of places' to the 'space of flows'. Castells argues that although organisation is not placeless, the traditional structures of social and political control have been subverted by the placeless logic of an internationalised economy enacted by means of information flows.²² Castells focuses particularly on linking contemporary globalisation processes to the increasing ingenuity and scale of communications technology. It is obvious that Castells gives great attribution to technological development in explaining globalisation processes.

In the book *Global Transformations; Politics, Economics and Culture*, Goldblatt et. al. provide a wide framework of understanding globalisation historically and in the contemporary. The authors argue that globalisation can be thought of as:

A process (or set of processes) which embodies a transformation in the spatial organization of social relations and transactions – assessed in terms of their extensity, intensity, velocity and impact – generating transcontinental or interregional flows and networks of activity, interaction, and the exercise of power²³

The authors argue that this definition allows for the organisation of comparative historical inquiries, and argue that a satisfactory understanding of globalisation must take into account that globalisation has spatially and temporally changed through different historical epochs and is itself a force of transformation that is continually transforming societies.²⁴

The implication here is that societies in their present forms are deeply affected by outcomes of social, political and economic developments globally, and circumstances change over time. Circumstances change due to globalisation processes, often for the worse. Many authors have stressed the negative sides of increasing global integration of economic markets. The link to capitalist exploitation is not uncommon in the literature on this topic.

Globalisation processes

Globalisation is often criticised for being a decidedly negative process of human exploitation and elitism. The sociologist Zygmunt Bauman sees globalisation as a process of polarisation between the wealthy and the poor, and argues that it is more correct to speak of a globalisation of the rich and a localisation of the poor²⁵. David Harvey argues in the book *Spaces of Hope*, that globalisation

²²Manuel Castells, *The informational city: Information technology, economic restructuring, and the urban-regional process* (Wiley-Blackwell, 1991), 169-171, 344-347.

²³David. Goldblatt et al., *Global transformations : politics, economics and culture* (Cambridge: Polity Press, 1999), 16.

²⁴Goldblatt et al., *Global transformations : politics, economics and culture*, 16-20.

²⁵Zygmunt Bauman, *Globalization : the human consequences* (Cambridge UK: Polity Press, 1998), 2.

is the language of oppression, confinement and homogenising processes. Harvey sees globalisation as processes that produce uneven temporal and geographical developments and ultimately leads to capitalist exploitation and hegemony.²⁶

Although globalisation undoubtedly has facilitated a lot of human suffering and inequality, denying the process because it is often oppressive will not change the fact that it is transforming society both for the better and for the worse. The history of globalisation processes can be seen as a history of the expansion of capitalism and exploitation, but it does not change the fact that it is an ongoing process with important social implications.

Scholte has an entirely different approach, he argues that although the effects of globalisation have been both positive (e.g. increased security, better humanitarian relief, economic development, cultural pluralism etc.) and negative (e.g. perpetuation of armed conflict, exploitation, poverty etc.) none of these consequences for human security have been intrinsic to globality per se. Scholte argues that each case has resulted from the policies adopted towards the reconfigured social geography, “political choice is the key”.²⁷

There are many authors that focus on the lacking ability to govern globalisation processes in a socially and politically egalitarian manner. Manuel Castells emphasizes that democracy needs to reinvent itself in order for people to have control over their lives in the increasing transformation of the informational society.²⁸ An example of such a reinvention may be the suggestion by the sociologist Anthony H. Richmond that global governance structures need to be built in order for globalisation to take place peacefully, constructively and with a vision that comprehends ideals of equality.²⁹

Globalisation and determinism

Globalisation processes have led to an increase in the global migration of sex-workers as well as in the trafficking of people for the sexual service industry. The question of whether or not there is a deterministic connection between globalisation and the increasingly global character of prostitution markets is often raised in academic debates. For instance, it is often argued that global sex tourism, global trade in prostitutes and the mail-order marriage business have increased violence towards women³⁰ and thus a direct causal relation between globalisation on the one hand and prostitution and trafficking on the other is established. However, as Scholte argues, it is worth questioning

²⁶David Harvey, *Spaces of hope* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2000), 53–60.

²⁷Jan Aart Scholte, *Globalization: A critical introduction* (Palgrave Macmillan, 2000), 6.

²⁸Manuel Castells, *The informational city: Information technology, economic restructuring, and the urban-regional process* (Wiley-Blackwell, 1991), 347.

²⁹Anthony H. Richmond, “Globalization: implications for immigrants and refugees,” *Ethnic and racial studies* 25, no. 5 (September 2002): 723.

³⁰Scholte, *Globalization: A critical introduction*, 30.

whether or not we can establish that negative effects are directly caused by globalisation processes and not by poor choices of policy. An important part of Scholte's argument is that the sheer increase in transplanetary communication and transportation brings with it an insecurity that is the main backdrop of globalisation.³¹ This normative or 'emotional' aspect of globalisation is also highlighted in the book *Globalization: The Key Concepts*, where Thomas Hylland Eriksen argues that it is foremostly the *perceived* vulnerability which has increased. According to Eriksen it is because "...the complexity of global systems precludes a proper overview and makes it difficult to make decisions on the basis of sound knowledge...".³² In other words, globalisation is to many people the scary set of 'unknowns' which can be blamed for the failures of political decision. When problems are not easily identified, globalisation is easy to blame. The practical reality of globalisation is a more complex world which people struggle to keep well informed about. Illicit trade and trafficking is a mere part of this. But as E. Hobsbawm argues in *Globalisation, Democracy and Terrorism*, it would be impossible for states to control or monitor everything that flows in and out of their territories without bringing economic activity to a grinding halt.³³

In a more gendered perspective it has been argued that economic globalisation leads to a partial 'feminization of survival'³⁴, particularly in developing countries where 'counter-geographies' emerge which utilize the facilities of economic globalisation for the spread of global trafficking and prostitution.³⁵ Saskia Sassen argues that the sex trade even becomes a development strategy in areas with high unemployment and poverty and where governments are desperate for revenue and foreign currency.³⁶

Globalisation itself is in many feminist perspectives seen as an integral part of the definition of trafficking. Maggy Lee, editor of *Human Trafficking*, argues that trafficking as form of slavery is marked by "...temporary ownership, debt bondage, forced labour and hyper-exploitative contractual arrangements in the global economy."³⁷ A typical historical example of this definition is the forced migration, enslavement and exploitation of Africans in the American continents which occurred in an emerging global economy of labour. Wallerstein illustrates in the aforementioned book how the slave trade in Africans in the 16th century was an integral part of the 'new European division of labour' which was integral to the global expansion of the European economies. It is based on the

31Ibid., 311–315.

32Thomas Hylland Eriksen, *Globalization: the key concepts* (Oxford: Berg Publishers, 2007), 127.

33Eric Hobsbawm, *Globalisation, democracy and terrorism* (London: Abacus, 2007), 145–146.

34Saskia Sassen, "Strategic instantiations of gendering in the global economy," in *Gender and US immigration: Contemporary trends*, ed. Pierrette Hondagneu-Sotelo (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 2003), 11–14.

35Saskia Sassen, "Women's Burden: Counter-Geographies of Globalization and the Feminization of Survival.," *Nordic Journal of International Law* 71, no. 2 (May 2002): 255-274.

36Ibid., 270.

37Maggy Lee, *Human trafficking* (Cullompton, Devon, U.K.: Willan, 2007), 3.

premise that massive exhaustion of existing labour forces in the European economies necessitated the exploitation of an external labour force in order to build the colonial economies.³⁸ Thus, Wallerstein argues that there is a direct causal relationship between the expansion of the global economies and the African slave trade. A significant difference between this analogy and the context of modern trafficking is that up until the 19th century there were no legal impediments to the enslavement of Africans, whilst in the modern day context any act of exploitation by way of debt-bondage, slavery or other forms of sexual exploitation is illegal in virtually all contexts. And this is an important point to underline because, in the modern context, trafficking in humans is not a driving force behind economic globalisation, on the contrary it is a bi-product of what Sassen called the “institutional facilities” produced by economic globalisation. Causal relations aside, it is important to note how intertwined globalisation and trafficking is in the modern context.

Transnationalism

Although the concept of transnationality is based on the notion of migrants and migrant communities *transcending* national boundaries, it is based on the premise of national and ethnic boundaries. This kind of conceptualisation is an element of what has been described as 'methodological nationalism' in the social sciences.

According to the sociologists Andreas Wimmer and Nina Glick Schiller, there are three major problems relating to methodological nationalism in the social sciences. The first is ignoring or disregarding the fundamental importance of nationalism in modern societies. The second is the naturalisation of the national as given units for analysis. The third is the limitation to territorial boundaries of nation states which confines the study of social processes to political and geographical boundaries.³⁹ Although the study of transnationalism breaks with the first and the third points of the problems posed by Schiller and Wimmer, it still reflects the second issue of methodological nationalism. It is based on the study of national or ethnic identities in contact with other national or ethnic identities, and the networks and relations which develop between nationalities and ethnic groups. Although I have chosen to see Nigerian women working in prostitution as a separate unit for analysis in this thesis, I argue that this is not because of any methodological sense of nationalism. There is simply very few, if any other ways of analysing this group. This is not to argue that they constitute a coherent or homogeneous group where everyone

³⁸Immanuel Wallerstein, *The modern world-system. 1 : Capitalist agriculture and the origins of the European world-economy in the sixteenth century*. (New York: Academic Press, 1974), 89–90.

³⁹Andreas Wimmer and Nina Glick Schiller, ““Methodological Nationalism, the Social Sciences, and the Study of Migrations“,” *International Migration Review* 37, no. 3 (Fall 2003): 578.

displays characteristics of the Nigerian nationality. Quite to the contrary, here the focus on the national origin is of little concern other than to illustrate that there is a common social, political and geographical origin. National characteristics, if such a thing exists in this context, are of little interest to this thesis.

There are highly differing views on the concept of transnationalism in relation to globalisation. Saskia Sassen sees transnational trends and developments as an inherent part of the globalisation processes. Sassen argues for a focus on the city in relation to the local and global level instead of the classical opposition of the national and the global.⁴⁰

Scholte argues against the use of the term transnationalism because the vocabulary of 'nationality' still takes the nation-state-country as its reference point and that it retains traces of methodological nationalism and statism. Scholte argues for an approach of 'globality' which avoids the domestic/foreign, internal/external dichotomies.⁴¹ Instead of the transnational, Scholte uses 'transworld' as an alternative concept.⁴² Although, Scholte does not specify how this new term is to be used or employed.

According to Nina Glick Schiller, Linda Basch and Christina Szanton Blanc in the article "From Immigrant to Transmigrant: Theorizing Transnational Migration", transnational processes are increasingly being seen as a part of the broader phenomenon of globalisation.⁴³ The authors of this article stress the apparent paradox that "...the age of transnationalism is a time of continuing and even heightening of nation state building processes".⁴⁴ The authors use both the terms 'transnational migrants' and 'transmigrants' in this article, though without specifying any difference between the terms. The term 'transmigrant' is, like Scholte's concept of 'transworld networks', an interesting term which totally avoids the boundaries of the 'national' in unit of analysis. However a critical argument against this view is that it may simplify or overlook the important implications the nation state paradigm has had and continues to have on international migration.

Stephen Castles argues in the article 'The Factors that Make and Unmake Migration Policies' that many of the forces driving migration follow a transnational logic, but Castles emphasises that it would be misleading to claim that the logic of globalisation or transnationalism has superseded the national logic.⁴⁵

40Saskia Sassen, *Globalization and Its Discontents: Essays on the New Mobility of People and Money* (New York: New Press, 1998), xx–xxi.

41Scholte, *Globalization: A critical introduction*, 65.

42Ibid., 153.

43Nina Glick Schiller, Linda Basch, and Christina Szanton Blanc, "From immigrant to transmigrant: Theorizing transnational migration," *Anthropological quarterly* (1995): 49.

44Ibid., 59.

45Stephen Castles, "The Factors that Make and Unmake Migration Policies," *International Migration Review* 38, no. 3 (Fall 2004): 864.

Theories on International Migration

There is not yet a single unifying theory in migration studies that can explain international migration, however there is a lot theoretical work that for now provides the framework for migration studies. Migration scholars are still debating the many theories which are intended to explain international migration. But despite the efforts laid down to create a unified migration theory, we have instead many different and fragmented theories with differing points of focus.⁴⁶ There are few outright errors in the theories, instead importance is given to different factors and different levels of perspective. These theories are to quite an extent overlapping, yet none of them single-handedly explain international migration. A theme that keeps occurring in this field of theoretical studies is that migration seems to be too complex and too unpredictable to be explained by a single theory. It is a phenomenon that is very difficult to grasp with a single theory. Instead, it is explained through a number of different concepts which come from different theories on international migration. In the following I will present only the particularly relevant parts of this body of theoretical work.

There are concepts and models in each of these theories which are more relevant than others for discussing the transformations in the prostitution market in the case of Stavanger.

In the first theory at hand, the *neo-classical theory*, wage-differentials between countries along with levels of employment opportunity plays the most significant role. Migration is seen as an individual act on the basis of cost-benefit assessments. This theory focuses on individuals as the main unit for analysis and sees the decisions to migrate as being mainly economically based. The origin of migration “...is to be sought in the in disparities in wage rates between countries, which in turn mirror income and welfare disparities”.⁴⁷

In the second theory, the *new economics theory*, migration is not merely an individual undertaking, it is a household or community strategy to maximise incomes and to minimise risks (e.g. crop failure, lacking social security etc.). In this theory the notion of *relative deprivation* is held to be an important factor, here households seek to improve their incomes and standards compared to a reference group.⁴⁸

In the third theory, the *segmented labour market theory*, also known as the *dual labour market*

46D. S Massey et al., “Theories of international migration: a review and appraisal,” *Population and development review*, no. 19.3 (1993): 431-466; Joaquin Arango, “Global Trends and Issues - Explaining Migration: A Critical View,” *International Social Science Journal* 52.3 (2000): 283-296.

47Arango, “Explaining Migration,” 285.

48Joaquin Arango et al., *Worlds in Motion: Understanding International Migration at the End of the Millennium* (Oxford; New York: Oxford University Press, 2008), 21–27.

theory, it is the expansion of modern industrial activity and markets that attract international migrants to the global labour market. This theory argues that modern societies are inherently in demand of migrants to meet the labour requirements, particularly in the lowest level of the employment hierarchies. Occupational hierarchies emerge in developed countries and migrants become necessary to occupy the jobs which the population in the destination countries refuse to take. In this theory a cornerstone is that international migration is largely based on demand, migrants fill the gaps that are structurally built in to modern societies.⁴⁹ The foremost proponent of this theory, Michael Piore, explains through a number of factors why highly developed countries are in permanent demand for foreign labour to fill jobs which native workers refuse to take.⁵⁰

In the fourth theory, the *world systems theory*, the historic and contemporary development of dependable connections between 'core-industrial' states and 'peripheral states' plays the key role in determining international migration. The links may be historical, economic, cultural, linguistic, ideological or geopolitical. In this theory the global economy is seen to be run by a handful of 'global' cities by which the world economy is managed. The penetration of capitalist economies into peripheral regions is seen as the initiator of international migration.⁵¹

The theories mentioned up to this point generally deal with the initiation of international migrations. They do not explain how migration often becomes a perpetuating system far beyond the significance of the initial catalyst. In the following theories the focus is more on what upholds migration patterns and flows over time.

In the *social capital theory*, the key concept lies in the accumulation of 'social capital'. The establishment and upkeep of interpersonal ties in international networks translates into opportunities for higher wage-levels or social security. In other words the networks between communities are forms of social capital that can translate into financial capital. In this theory migration networks play the main role in perpetuating migration patterns. Migrant institutions and industries emerge as a result of the demands created by growing networks and migrant communities.⁵² Although, social capital theory has its fair share of flaws, it is still widely held that migration networks is a key determinant in international migration. As Arango writes, "...the importance of social networks can hardly be overstated..."⁵³

Finally, in the *cumulative causation theory*, international migration over time becomes self-perpetuating. Initial migration changes the contexts within which future migration decisions are

49Ibid., 28–34.

50Arango, "Explaining Migration," 288.

51Arango et al., *Worlds in Motion*, 34–41.

52Ibid., 44–45.

53Arango, "Global Trends and Issues," 291.

made, typically in ways that make additional migrations more likely.⁵⁴ A particularly interesting concept in this theory is that migration can become culture, in that it may change the values and perceptions of communities in ways that make future migrations more likely.⁵⁵

There are many problems with all of these theories, the fundamental issue is placing the often chaotic and unpredictable global patterns of migration into a unifying theory. The concepts and ideas of the various theories are on the other hand highly useful for analyses of international migration.

Globalisation and Migration Theory

As seen in the article “Theories on International Migration: A Review and Appraisal”, by Douglas Massey et al. many of the theories on international migration highlight the process of globalisation as a major factor. In fact, most of the theories as presented in the article “Theories on International Migration: A Review and Appraisal” by Douglas Massey et al., deal with certain sides of the globalisation processes.

In the network approach, migration is seen as a self-sustaining diffusion process. Here migration is mainly related to the development of interpersonal ties, lowering the costs and risks of the migration process.⁵⁶ The network approach has the process of globalisation as a fundamental premise (eg. the initial migration process, the possibilities of communication and transportation across space, and the means to uphold social relations).

In the world systems theory, migration is a natural consequence of economic globalisation and market penetration across national boundaries. It highlights the concepts of capitalist penetration, 'global cities', colonialism and ideological and cultural connections. Migrations follow the expanding global markets and are results of economic proliferation.

In the migration systems approach, migrations form multi-polar systems which evolve. Stability of the systems do not necessarily imply fixed structures. The major focus of this theory is that migration flows reflect political and economic relations.⁵⁷

The problems with the world systems theory and the migration systems approach are that they do not sufficiently encompass the local. They are too heavily based on the macro-perspective and remove focus from the social transformations and interpersonal ties. Moreover, they do not sufficiently encompass the role of the nation states in migrations. However, these are not universal

⁵⁴Arango et al., *Worlds in Motion*, 45–46.

⁵⁵Ibid., 47.

⁵⁶Massey et al., “Theories of international migration: a review and appraisal.”

⁵⁷Ibid.

theories on migration in general and clearly focus on international migrations.

All of these theories deal with different factors and perspectives in explaining migrations. They illustrate how diverse and complex the processes of migrations are. However, it cannot be overstated how intertwined migration and globalisation is. Stephen Castles underlines that globalisation creates the cultural capital and technical means needed for migration. He argues that globalisation essentially means flows of capital, commodities, ideas and *people* across borders.⁵⁸ This is the core connection between migration and globalisation.

Historical perspectives of globalisation and migration

The assumption that globalisation is mainly economically driven has according to Shaw led to a misleading historical debate.⁵⁹ The need to change this assumption can best be seen through looking at historical examples. The European overseas expansion during the colonial period can be explained entirely as a result of capitalist economic expansion, however it does not explain social interactions or say anything about the experiences of individual migrants. Globalisation in the contemporary is also often seen from this economic view, but it cannot sufficiently explain the creation of relations and connections across nationalities and borders. The economic globalisation model does not explain how immigrants from all over Europe integrated into American society, or how they established and maintained relations across the Atlantic in the 19th and 20th centuries. The economic globalisation perspective can explain initial migration through classical push- and pull models, dual labour market systems or world systems theories but it does not sufficiently take into account the human agency and social interactions that characterise migrations. Through the approach of globalisation as a social and political transformation, the networks and communication between people become the main element in explaining migration patterns. Globalisation has to be seen in a historical context, the processes of social and political transformation can only be adequately understood through historical awareness. It is the lack of historical understanding that leads to the notions of globalisation as a paradigmatic modern phenomenon.

Conceptualising migration and prostitution

Due to the current foreign composition of the prostitution market in Stavanger it is safe to assume that migration, and thus, migration theory is at the centre of the issue. There are many perspectives one can take even on the small scale case of the prostitution market in Stavanger . One could try to

⁵⁸Castles, "The Factors that Make and Unmake Migration Policies," 862.

⁵⁹Martin Shaw, "Globality and Historical Sociology," in *Historical sociology of international relations*, ed. Stephen Hobden and John M. Hobson (Cambridge, UK; New York: Cambridge University Press, 2002), 86.

look at this market and describe it through a number of different concepts. The transnational theories, described by Steven Vertovec in *Transnationalism* focus on the importance of interpersonal networks crossing national borders, and over time possibly establishing self-sustaining patterns of transnational migration. This including the trans- nationalisation of the trafficking of goods and people.⁶⁰

Prostitution can be seen in a whole range of different normative perspectives, and many authors have written widely different conceptualisation. A significant problem with many of the older studies of this topic is that they focus on prostitution as a social problem, and as a victim-generating phenomenon. However, in recent years there has emerged a new kind of discourse on prostitution in the social sciences that dismisses this narration of prostitution. One of the main proponents of this new discourse, Laura Agustín, argues that since the enlightenment there has emerged a “social order”, which firstly conceptualized prostitution as morally wrong and then later has evolved into a dominant discourse where prostitutes are conceived as victims and in need of third party intervention.⁶¹

Prostitution is often simply a survival strategy, and because migrants are a particularly vulnerable group the chances of migrants using this strategy is arguably higher than for other groups.

In concluding this chapter we may shortly summarize that international migration and globalisation process are closely intertwined. In fact it often seems hard to separate one from the other.

Furthermore, we may note that there are many useful approaches and concepts on international migration that will be useful for the discussions in chapter 5, however, there is no unifying theory to place empirical material into. In the following chapter I will present the prostitution markets of Stavanger as well as connect them to a larger context of transnational activity.

⁶⁰Steven Vertovec, *Transnationalism* (London and New York: Routledge, Taylor & Francis Group, 2009), 5, 34–35.

⁶¹Agustín, (2007) 96–133.

3. The Marketplace

In this chapter I will look into the concrete case of Stavanger and expand on the relevant concepts and conclusions found in other studies. The main purpose of this chapter is to show what the local prostitution market of Stavanger is like, and how it relates to other markets in Norway and Europe. Before going into the findings, a brief introduction of the field work and the organisation it was conducted in is necessary.

The field-work that was conducted for this thesis was done by joining the NGO *Albertine prosjektet*, on their 'outreach'-program for a period spanning more than 18 months. The Stavanger-based organisation is a sub-project under the Stavanger city-mission. It is an aid organisation working to help the people in the prostitution market in the Stavanger area. It is funded both by the local government and by the national government and is a part of a larger team along with the local government and the Stavanger police department to help victims of trafficking.

Albertine Prosjektet has four permanent employees, two social workers, a nurse and a doctor. The organisation is open every day where they receive mostly women working in prostitution and offer them assistance with medical treatment and advice as well as many different kinds of practical assistance which may be needed. This organisation also spends a significant amount of time on researching and documenting the prevalence of prostitution in the Stavanger area. They focus on both the 'outdoor'- and the 'indoor'- markets.

The organisation spends a significant amount of time on their outreach-program which consists of one of the permanent employees along with one of the volunteers going out in a car with food, drinks, condoms and lubricants three evenings every week (mondays, tuesdays and thursdays). On these trips they drive around in the most common streets that make up the outdoor market of Stavanger, notably the area known as 'Strandkaaien' which stretches from the western part of the central 'Vågen' harbour up to the central post-office and along parts of the old part of Stavanger called 'gamle Stavanger'. It is a fairly small part of the western city centre.

On these trips the outreach-program offers the women working the streets of Stavanger to come into the car either for warmth or to talk about whatever is on their minds. These meetings are very important as they are a good way of letting the street-workers know about *Albertine Prosjektet* and giving them the opportunity to make appointments for seeing the doctor. These trips are also important because the face to face contact allows for a much greater understanding of what happens on the streets.

The organisation also spends time researching the indoor-market of Stavanger by monitoring websites and advertisements for prostitution-services. They normally call the telephone numbers to let the people know about *Albertine Prosjektet* and that they can get help there if they need it. This work also lets them get an overview over how many people and from which countries are working in prostitution in the Stavanger area at any given time. They also extensively send out text-messages to the telephone numbers on these adverts which they send in a number of different languages. Due to the work of *Albertine Prosjektet* the outdoor prostitution market in Stavanger is relatively transparent. The organisation has been monitoring and documenting prostitution both on the outdoor- and indoor-markets in Stavanger since 2005. The information from the annual reports of *Albertine Prosjektet* gives an thorough perspective on the development of the prostitution market in Stavanger.

The Outdoor Market

According to *Albertine Prosjektet* the outdoor-market was already dominated by Nigerian women when the organisation started documentation in 2005. The number of Norwegian women on the outdoor-market has steadily declined from 22 women in 2005 to zero cases noted in 2010. The number of Nigerian women on the same market has been on average 32 since 2005, with a peak of 42 in the initial year and with the lowest point at 24 in 2009 which coincided with the introduction of the law prohibiting the purchase of sexual services in Norway. In the year 2010 the number was slightly over the average at 33 and for the year 2011 the number is expected to be significantly higher. There have also been noted some women from other parts of the world on the outdoor-market, but in 2010 there were only 3 cases noted, and all of which were Bulgarian. Therefore, since 2010 we may summarize that the market in Stavanger is almost totally consisting of Nigerian women.⁶²

Many of these women stay in Stavanger for certain periods before leaving, others again stay in Stavanger at intervals, while still others stay on and try to gain residence by various means. Especially this group has shown an ability of self-perpetuation in that the women themselves or in assistance with others get more women from Nigeria to come to Stavanger for work in the 'outdoor' prostitution market.

Given the fact that every evening in Stavanger there are approximately 30 women working the 'outdoor' market and a similar number on the indoor market, we can deduce that there is a high demand for prostitutional services in the Stavanger area.

⁶²Albertine Prosjektet, *Annual Report 2010 (orig. Årsrapport 2010)* (Stavanger, 2011).

What is going on in Stavanger is not unique within the national context, nor is it in the European. The changes in the 'outdoor' market of Stavanger follow the same patterns and show the same migration flows as does that of Bergen, Oslo and Trondheim before it. Similarly the cities of Norway show the same development as many other European cities in street-prostitution markets, most notably those of Italy and Spain. If one sees the phenomenon of trafficking of Nigerian women as a European wide phenomenon, it is staggering what kind of numbers, and ultimately, how many people are involved. Nigerian trafficking networks in Europe arguably operate in a series of typical ways. When we look at the larger perspective of this type of migration an enormous scale and intricacy emerges.

Destination Europe

Already in 2005 it was estimated that there may have been as many as 10,000 Nigerian women working in prostitution in Italy.⁶³ As of 2011 some researchers say the figure may have risen to be in excess of 20,000 Nigerian women in the Italian prostitution market.⁶⁴

Jørgen Carling of the PRIO institute in Oslo wrote the paper "Migration, human smuggling and trafficking from Nigeria to Europe" which still seven years on is perhaps the most thorough examination of trafficking of Nigerian women to Europe. What is remarkable about reading this paper today is that not only do we still find the same patterns and trends which Carling pointed out in 2005, we find a significant increase in the exact same patterns. Despite the fact that much has been known about these findings for several years, European countries have been unable to tackle this issue adequately, instead this form of trafficking to Europe has steadily increased in scale. Much of the reason for this is due to the fact that Nigerian trafficking networks are notoriously difficult to penetrate. Nigerian trafficking networks have become infamous for their psychological control of participants by use of so-called 'juju'-rituals which are local Nigerian traditional religious rites.⁶⁵

As Carling writes

Violent assault is undoubtedly common, but neither a rule nor a necessity in the Nigerian model of trafficking. The psychological control the traffickers have over the women often makes violence unnecessary... ..This contrasts with trafficking of eastern European women (Becucci and Massari, 2003; Carchedi *et al*, 2003; Okojie *et al*, 2003).⁶⁶

⁶³Jørgen Carling, *Migration, human smuggling and trafficking from Nigeria to Europe* (Geneva: IOM, 2006), 45.

⁶⁴James Jones, "Nigeria: Sex, Lies and Black Magic," *Unreported World* (UK: Channel 4, April 5, 2011).

⁶⁵Carling, (2006), 48.

⁶⁶Ibid.

Carling goes on to discuss how there are many potential sources of violence which the women are at risk of simply by being a part of the market in Italy. The women are at risk of violence from customers, competing prostitution groups and are regarded with contempt by parts of Italian society.

⁶⁷ It is largely due to the psychological control mechanisms along with threats of or use of violence towards victims of trafficking or their families that so few are willing to provide information that may lead to unravelling the networks which brought them to Europe.

Another important socio-psychological motive among these women seems to be the 'European dream'. The seeming promises of going to Europe are often so strong and socially important that the fact that they will be working in prostitution is overcome simply because going to Europe would be expected to ensure their otherwise highly uncertain upward social and economic mobility. It shares many similarities with the 'American dream' in 19th century Europe, where people believed that simply getting to America would improve their lives. Hardships which may have to be endured were often ignored in favour of the enticing idea of leaving to another continent of seemingly grand opportunity. This is a very integral part of the Nigerian trafficking networks because many of the women involved get involved knowingly and willingly precisely because the 'European dream' suppresses other concerns.

There is significant reason to argue that the Nigerian immigrant women on the outdoor market of Stavanger display typical traits and characteristics seen in Nigerian trafficking networks in other Norwegian and European cities. Although, lacking testimonial proof, there is significant reason to argue that so many of these characteristics can be found here that we can conclude that the prostitution market in Stavanger is very likely to be made up of one or more typical Nigerian trafficking networks.

Networks and Structures

The networks and structures of the sort found among Nigerian trafficking networks rely heavily the functions of modern communication and transportation. But it also relies on social and political developments. Political changes such as widening of the Schengen area has increased internal European mobility and therefore also internal trafficking. Entire industries of migrations flourish on facilitating parts of the trafficking process. Document forgers, smugglers and guides are among those that benefit from assisting in the trafficking process, not to mention the 'madams' and 'sponsors' at the centre of the networks.

⁶⁷Ibid., 49.

Nigerian Trafficking Networks

Although it is very hard to find concrete evidence that the Nigerian trafficking networks in Stavanger have the same kind of structures as seen in other places in Europe, it is hard to imagine that they are significantly different when every other major aspects of their mode of operation is near identical to that found in European cities where the network structures have become known. According to numerous studies, investigations and reports there are certain typical patterns in Nigerian trafficking networks. These networks are not always the same and there are variations in size and local adaptations. However, it is generally held that Nigerian trafficking networks in Europe have two distinct organisational elements. The first is the 'sponsor', economically responsible for new recruits to Europe. Sponsors are often themselves Nigerian women who have been working in street-prostitution in Europe and have repaid their debts and have chosen to invest in recruiting women into their trafficking network for economic profit.⁶⁸

Secondly there is the 'madam' who works as acting street-level authority in charge of demanding in debt as well as charging 'rent' for the places where the girls work and stay. According to Nwando Achebe the madams will typically 'buy' the debt which the trafficked recruits owes her sponsor and ultimately the trafficked woman will have to work off this debt which typically will in the range of 50,000-100,000 US\$.⁶⁹ Usually the girls manage to repay their debt in a matter of several years of work in European prostitution markets. It is important to bear in mind that it is unlikely that every network and every victim of trafficking has been through the exact same process as described above. However, it is an organisational type where a 'sponsor', and a 'madam' together with certain religious rituals make up the typical Nigerian trafficking network in the European context. These networks are far from unified in some kind of larger organization with sole benefactors. On the contrary the Nigerian networks appear to be multiple with competing groups and rivals with conflicts (often violent) over markets and women.

'Juju', 'voodoo' and 'black magic of Africa'

Although resulting in significant media scares where 'voodoo zombies' made headlines in European countries such as the Netherlands in the 1990s, local traditional religious beliefs and rituals surviving Christian and Islamic missions live on in Nigeria as in other West- and South-African states. The most common among these beliefs found among the Nigerian women working in Europe is referred to as 'Juju'. It is widely held among researchers today that the majority of Nigerian women undergo 'Juju'-rituals before leaving to Europe, whereby they swear an oath to repay their

⁶⁸Carling (2006).

⁶⁹Nwando Achebe, "The Road to Italy: Nigerian Sex Workers at Home and Abroad," *Journal of Women's History* 15, no. 4 (2004): 182.

sponsor and not to reveal their traffickers or madams to anyone. These rituals were uncovered among teenage Nigerian asylum-seekers in the Netherlands in the end of the 1990s,⁷⁰ and since then virtually every study done on the topic of Nigerian trafficking and street prostitution in Europe has included, and often had lengthy discussions, about the presence, effect and importance of Juju-rituals among Nigerian trafficking victims. Both 'Juju' and 'Voodoo' are terms that have been used about various kinds of magical rituals that are intended to influence events in the world.⁷¹ As Carling writes, this kind of traditional rituals are practised openly both by Christians and Muslims in large parts of Nigeria. Although many people in Nigeria also reject these beliefs, which I also have had confirmed in the case of Stavanger, it seems that this kind of ritual is an integral part of the contractual arrangements involved with the trafficking of women from Nigeria to Europe.⁷² The Nigerian prostitution networks in Norway have attracted a lot of attention, and there are many typical discourses that have been employed in the media on this topic.

Discourse

The Nigerian women receive a great deal of attention both at the local and national levels in Norwegian media and politics. In 2008 the visual presence of the women on the streets of Norway reached such a level that the media and politicians alike were calling for new and tougher legislation to remove this new, and visually noticeable group from streets of the Norwegian cities. In January of 2009 the purchasing of sexual services was made illegal by Norwegian law after the Swedish model (introduced in Sweden only a few years earlier). However, three years on there is an increasing realization that not much has changed since the introduction of this law.

The media in Stavanger have already written hundreds of articles about this one particular group, they are in most cases identified as 'Nigerian Prostitutes'⁷³, as a coherent homogeneous group who are here seeking capitalist venture. In most media and political discourses they are rarely identified as socio-economic losers or as victims of globalised trafficking and global criminal networks. One of the local papers *Rogalandsavis* uses a distinctively hostile and negative discourse often using the terminology of 'whores'⁷⁴ in their articles. The political debate in Stavanger is also identifying this

70Rijk Van Dijk, "‘Voodoo’ on the Doorstep: Young Nigerian Prostitutes and Magic Policing in the Netherlands," *Africa* 71, no. 4 (2001): 565.

71Carling, (2006), 15.

72Ibid., 15-16.

73There have been written hundreds of articles on the topic by Norwegian press over the past 8 years. The national Newspapers *VG* and *Dagbladet* frequently write on the topic of prostitution, particularly about Nigerian women in the outdoor markets of Norway. The two largest local newspapers in Stavanger, *Rogalandsavis* and *Stavanger Aftenblad*, have also written numerous articles about the Nigerian women in the outdoor-markets.

74The article by Jon Kristian Fadnes, "Horekrangel på Strandkaaien," *Rogalandsavis* (Stavanger, January 31, 2011). is an example from January of 2011, the title translates to 'whore-fight in Strandkaaien'.

group of women as a distinct and seemingly unsolvable social problem.

There are many questions which arise through the identification of this group and why it is specifically receiving so much attention. What exactly are these women being identified as? Who are the identifiers, and what are the political implications? Moreover, why is this group creating such an enormous amount of political and media discourse in spite of the fact that prostitution in Norway is not at all a new phenomenon? Is this a form of racism, concealed in political correctness? Is it the visually noticeable presence which is the triggering mechanism?

Wrongness?

Much has been written about the apparent difference in the mode of operation, between the Nigerian women working in prostitution and their European counterparts. The Norwegian social-scientist May-Len Skilbrei has written about how Nigerian women in prostitution tend to be much more intrusive in their behaviour, actively approaching men in a more direct manner than the European women working in prostitution. Skilbrei also notes that these women tend to seek out unconventional locations for working, seeking out the more frequented areas of the cities, and not staying in the more established areas of prostitution. Skilbrei summarized her findings in that these women appear to the public to be 'the wrong women in the wrong place'.⁷⁵

The idea of 'matter out of place' by Mary Douglas is a useful analogy for this case. In the book *Purity and Danger* Douglas makes a very interesting and highly relevant conceptualisation of *pollution*. Douglas argues that notions of dirt, uncleanness and pollution are all relative notions which are intrinsically linked to the social context. In short, Douglas argues that things are not inherently dirty, unclean or polluted, rather it is the things' relative displacement that make people see them as dirty, unclean or polluted. Something is dirty, unclean or polluted if it is 'matter out of place', and which is displaced beyond the limits of our socially accepted margins of deviation.⁷⁶

When connected to the case of street-level prostitution as described by Skilbrei, it certainly makes for a logical reasoning for why the women who sell sexual services in the 'wrong manner and place' are seen as 'polluting' the centre of Stavanger.

The street market in Stavanger is almost exclusively comprised of Nigerian women, the market has become polarised between Nigerians on the streets while almost all other groups and individuals including Norwegians work indoors. There has been a significant distancing between the women on the indoor-market to the Nigerian women on the streets with among others accusations that they are

⁷⁵May-Len Skilbrei, "Nigeriansk prostitusjon på norsk: Feil kvinner på feil sted," in *Norske Seksualiteter*, ed. Åse Røthing and Wencke Mühleisen (Oslo: Cappelen akademisk forlag, 2009), 165–184.

⁷⁶Mary Douglas, *Purity and Danger: an Analysis of the Concepts of Pollution and Taboo* (London: Routledge, 2001), 36–41.

ruining the market by offering services for prices that Norwegians and others cannot or would not compete with. Also, stigmatization of Nigerians living in Norway has been evident in several well known cases. African women have been approached in completely detached settings and have been expected to sell sexual services. Needless to say, this is experienced as highly offensive by these women, several of whom have experienced this form of sexual harassment on many occasions. One African journalist living in Stavanger has written about her own experiences, where she expresses the difficulties and social stigma she has endured since this group became commonly mediated.⁷⁷

On the whole, there are many critical issues with the discourses surrounding

In the master thesis in sociology “Women Who Cross Borders – Black Magic?: A

critical discourse analysis of the Norwegian newspaper coverage of Nigerian women in prostitution in Norway” Synnøve Økland Jahnsen writes about the discourses on Nigerian sex workers in the Norwegian media. Jahnsen found that the newspaper coverage of Nigerian women in prostitution in Norway,

...carries and re-informs cultural stereotypes, presuppositions and prejudices which can be traced in the dominant colonial cultural imagery and the construction of a cultural “Other” – descending from the myths of “the dark and sexual uninhibited African woman” and in the myth on prostitution and the social relationships within prostitution, where the main characters are presented to be “the prostitute”, “the customer” and “the pimp”⁷⁸

Furthermore, Jahnsen argues that instead of critically recognizing the immediate need for accommodation and recognition of failed international policies on female immigration, media frenzies on the sensational subject of 'vice' and 'voodoo' time and again, serves to trivialize societal and structural issues.⁷⁹

What seems to be the case in Stavanger is that negatively laden discourses, such as the frequently used 'aggressive prostitute', seems to be the rule. Instead of discourses that stress desperation local discourses construct these women as 'aggressive' threats.⁸⁰ At this point it seems fitting to introduce some of the factors in the country of origin that may shed some light over what is going on beneath the discursive surface.

⁷⁷Frode M. Gjerald, “Lei Av Horestempel,” *Rogalandsavis* (Stavanger, 20.10.2006).

⁷⁸Synnøve Økland Jahnsen, “Women who cross borders–black magic? A Critical Discourse Analysis of the Norwegian newspaper coverage” (Bergen UIB, 2007), 101.

⁷⁹Ibid.

⁸⁰In the period 2007 to 2012 the local newspaper *Rogalandsavis* have published 20 articles online that uses the terminology of “aggressive prostitution” in describing the outdoor-market of Stavanger. The other main media outlet for Stavanger, *Stavanger Aftenblad*, have also published more than 14 articles online using the same terminology spanning the period from 2002 until 2012. In addition to these articles there have been many more articles in the same newspapers that exclusively have been published in the physical paper versions.

Factors in Areas of Origin

There are pressing factors in Nigeria which makes emigration a key part of the options which the younger generations have to choose between. According to the UNDP Development Report of 2004, 44% of the Nigerian population were below the age of 19. In 2006 the population was measured in the National Population Census to be 140 million persons.⁸¹ This means that there is a huge adolescent and young adult population in Nigeria which creates a lot of pressure on labour markets and employment opportunities. According to Christina Okojie of Benin University, many researchers have traced the start of trafficking in Nigerian Women to Italy to the second half of the 1980s, as a result of economic depression in Nigeria and the adoption of the Structural Adjustment Programme (SAP). As Okojie writes

Failure of the Structural Adjustment Programme to regulate the economic situation and the massive debt of Nigeria until recently, resulted in slow economic growth, leading millions to descend into poverty. The resulting economic deprivations forced many Nigerians to leave the country in search of better economic opportunities in Europe, Saudi Arabia, the United States, and other countries. This period marked the beginning or escalation of the brain drain out of Nigeria. Persistent unemployment among the youth and rising poverty led to the young and old desiring to go out of the country in search of greener pastures. It also marked the beginning of trafficking in women and minors and escalation of illegal migration out of the country. While the well-educated Nigerians usually found it easier to obtain visas and work permits, this was not the case with the less educated youth, male and female.⁸²

Okojie sees poverty and unemployment as the two most significant factors which make up the push factors in Nigeria. The dichotomy of deprivation versus affluence in practice becomes the choice between enduring poverty at home or success abroad at the cost of bound exploitation.

Nwando Achebe, also emphasises the importance of the economic crises in 1980s Nigeria and the adverse effects the IMF-sponsored SAP had. According to Achebe it is not merely physical poverty that drives women to leave Nigeria for work in prostitution in Europe. The psychological effects of enduring social and economic poverty led to significant changes in attitudes. Achebe argues in the article "The Road to Italy: Nigerian Sex Workers at Home and Abroad",

Another unfortunate side effect of SAP has been the emergence of a "get rich quickly" syndrome that was encouraged by a general poverty of the mind, body, and soul of the Nigerian nation. This social and economic poverty has afforded Nigerians who have secured, through corruption, positions of honor and admiration in society. It is this guaranteed prestige that Nigerian sex

⁸¹Christina E.E. Okojie, "International Trafficking of Women for The Purpose of Sexual Exploitation and Prostitution. The Nigerian Case," *Pakistan Journal of Women's Studies: Alam-e-Niswan* 16, no. 1&2 (2009): 155.

⁸²Ibid.

workers and madams have managed to appropriate. When one adds to the equation a general lack of education and vocational training so common among these sex workers, then one can begin to understand why Nigerian girls and women choose to become international prostitutes.⁸³

The conclusion Achebe reaches in this article is that forms of prostitution found locally in Nigeria have an entirely different character than that of the international stage. She explains that, although vastly varied from place to place, the local 'prostitute' (not necessarily defined as such), often served a community service and a community need. They were not look down upon but rather revered for being autonomous and liberated. Achebe argues that it is first when the Nigerian women are dislocated from their families, support-networks and live at the mercy of their traffickers and pimps that they find themselves in an extremely powerless position.⁸⁴

Perhaps one of the most important factors is that the state of Nigeria suffers from endemic corruption. It is obvious that one of the core issues in why and how international prostitution is made possible is because of the inherent corruption of the state system. Some authors have even argued that there exists a 'culture of corruption' in parts of Nigeria.⁸⁵

The Nigerian lawyer Nuhu Ribadu, who was forced into exile in Britain (2008-2010) because of his role as head prosecutor of the Nigerian Economic and Financial Crimes Commissions, writes

Let it be clear from the onset that my intention is not to speak ill of my country or continent, but, rather to state the facts as they are.

Next year, Nigeria will be half a century old. In 1960, the year I was born, my country attained Independence from Britain. The promise of independence was boundless and the famous Nigerian energy was all too evident. We were sure we would make it. Home to about 140 million of the West African region's 220 million inhabitants, Nigeria's demography alone elects it as a regional power.

Today, after one civil war, seven military regimes, and three botched attempts at building real democracy, there is one connecting factor in the failure of all attempts to govern Nigeria: corruption.⁸⁶

In his testimony to the US House of Financial Services committee in 2009 Ribadu paints a picture of a lawless country where 'cleptocratic fraudsters' rule throughout the state, draining Nigeria and

83Achebe, (2004) 181.

84Ibid., 183.

85O. Agbu, "Corruption and human trafficking: The Nigerian case," *West Africa Review* 4, no. 1 (2003): 1-13; C. L. Ochulor, C. Metuonu Iheanacho, and O. O Asuo, "Corruption in contemporary Nigeria: The way out," *Am. J. Soc. Mgmt. Sci* 2, no. 1 (2011): 91-99; Ebenezer. Obadare and Wale. Adebaniwi, *Encountering the Nigerian state* (New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010); D. E Agbibo, "Between Corruption and Development: The Political Economy of State Robbery in Nigeria," *Journal of Business Ethics* (2009): 1-21.

86Nuhu Ribadu, "Capital Loss and Corruption: the Example of Nigeria; Testimony Before the House Financial Services Committee," *US House Committee on Financial Services* (May 19, 2009): 1-2.

and nearby countries in the region of some 20 billions dollars (US\$) each year.⁸⁷

The case of Ribadu shows how extensive corruption has become in Nigeria, and the heights of power it reaches. However, this case also illustrates that there are people, few but determined, who are willing to fight hard against large scale corruption.

The Indoor-Market

The indoor-market of Stavanger is fundamentally different from the outdoor market. The indoor market involves much larger sums of money and is in many ways defined by modern information technology. It generally takes place in hotels and private homes and internet websites act as social network 'hubs' where providers and customers connect.⁸⁸ A key aspect of this modern 'internet-booked' prostitution is the 'touring'-style of working. The men, women and trans-genders that work in this market will often travel through the major cities of Norway almost like a 'tour'. They set up their working activity into periods of intensive intervals going from one city to another before leaving the market for vacations of various lengths.⁸⁹

The internet websites are not located on Norwegian servers because they would be subject to Norwegian legal sanctions for breaching Norwegian law. Instead the servers are located in other European states where the legal frameworks are different and do not hinder this kind of activity. In much the same way as internet gambling websites have managed to sidetrack Norwegian laws prohibiting gambling, the 'escort-websites' change their server-locations to places with more suitable laws. This is another direct indication of the significance the increasing interconnection of information has in transcending the state frameworks. In the 'pre-internet' period, advertisement for prostitution occurred most frequently in the 'contact ads' in various magazines and often caused significant legal complications for the publishers who time and again were taken to court by Norwegian authorities. The most noticed case of this type was the 'E-zone' case where the magazine 'E-zone' was taken to court accused of pimping after publishing advertisements.⁹⁰

There is on the whole a very different discourse surrounding this part of the Norwegian prostitution market. The people on this market are generally referred to as escorts or luxury-prostitutes and represent an image of a higher socio-economic class compared to the Nigerian women on the

⁸⁷Ibid., 3.

⁸⁸The websites such as www.hemmelig.com, www.escort-date.eu, www.escortdate.com/no, www.realescort.eu along with various other websites are the key places where the connections and arrangements between service providers and customers are made.

⁸⁹This is easy to identify on these websites, typically many people usually write in their internet advertisements when they will be in which city.

⁹⁰Tor-Erling Thømt Ruud and Rolf J. Widerøe, "Sexkjøpannonser Er Ikke Ulovlig," *VG*, (Oslo, 28.10.2011)

outdoor-market. There have also been cases of trafficking within the indoor market of Stavanger, most notably a case in 2010 where a man was convicted of trafficking and pimping regarding more than two dozen women brought to Stavanger for purposes of exploitation working in the indoor prostitution market.⁹¹

The indoor-market is on the whole much more discrete and invisible than the outdoor-market. This is likely also one of the reasons why this market receives less media and political attention. The people working in the indoor market are much more often described in more neutral or extravagant terms such as 'escorts' or 'luxury prostitutes' compared to the 'whore'- and 'aggressive prostitute'-terminology which regularly appears in media discourses on the Nigerian women in the outdoor-market. The people that work in the Norwegian indoor market do not necessarily live in Norway either, a large group appear to reside in countries within reasonable flying distances. It seems clear that the indoor market is an example of transnational network activity that transcends national frameworks and creates regional systems. The Norwegian market has become so closely linked to the surrounding countries that it seems more correct to discuss a regional- rather than national-market.

In summing up this chapter we may identify that there are significant differences between the workings of the two prostitution markets of Stavanger. However, the common denominator for both is the network activity which is transcending national frameworks and establishing global and regional patterns. In the next chapter I will move on to discuss some of the approaches that have emerged in the studies on prostitution and trafficking.

⁹¹Kjell Arne Knutsen, "Dømt for menneskehandel og hallikvirksomhet," *Stavanger Aftenblad* (Stavanger, 05.07.2010)

4. Sex as Liberation or Exploitation?

The debate about prostitution and trafficking is most often shaped by questions of how to govern or criminalise the issue. It is fundamentally based on the idea that the majority population have the right or obligation to intervene on the behaviour of a group of people. In this chapter I will illustrate some of the key elements in the debates surrounding human trafficking and transnational prostitution, before providing some empirical examples.

What is a Social Problem?

There is no easy way to go about defining what is or is not a social problem, not to mention deciding what requires intervention and what does not. Or if it at all is correct to embark on an authoritative discourse in which the majority 'We' decide what is best for minority 'Other'. However, it is still the belief of this author that, post-modern rhetoric aside, in certain cases a spade is simply a spade. There are issues which are problematic with the prostitution market in Stavanger and this should be pointed out. Trafficked women that are practically here as indentured prostitutes both in the outdoor and the indoor markets. There are documented cases of violence between groups of women on the streets, none of which ended with anyone pressing police charges.⁹² There have also been cases of violence towards the women in the prostitution market by customers as well as various cases of fraudulent behaviour by customers towards the women (e.g. withdrawing payments). Can we in the case of Stavanger argue that there is a social problem with prostitution?

A Local Problem

If it is established that the vast majority of the women involved were trafficked to Europe, and that many will be living as indentured prostitutes paying down their debts under harsh and violent conditions, we may conclude that it is a significant problem. It violates laws and it contradicts basic principles of human liberty. But it is not merely illegal, it is also harsh for the thousands of people it involves. This is an issue which has suffered much political failure. There seems to be a general lack of knowledge, will and ability to solve the core issues. It is a paradox that this phenomenon has

⁹²It is difficult to tell whether or not these cases of violence were due to competition over markets, or internal disagreements within one group and why no one seems to be willing to press charges. In one particular incident there were so many different stories flourishing that there is little hope to actually understand what happened. As far as I have been able to find out there have not been pressed any charges against anyone working in the prostitution market in Stavanger by anyone else working in the same market. It is likely that competition over markets and specific places are significant issues in the outdoor-market of Stavanger, there is significant information that suggests this is the case.

been able to continue for so long, despite that it so fundamentally breaks with the vision and principles of the Norwegian inclusive and egalitarian society.

So why is it that a well-functioning and solidly funded state seems unable to solve the issue of trafficking for street prostitution in Norway?

The obvious and most significant reason is the large base of customers. The only reason why there are so many women both on the outdoor and indoor market in the Stavanger is because of the large number of customers. Despite or even because of the financial crises there is a significant increase in women working in Stavanger prostitution markets. Many other parts of Europe have been hit hard by economic crises while Norway appears largely untouched and continues to prosper economically. *Pro-senteret* in Oslo, which is an NGO working to aid women in prostitution in the Oslo area, reported that women on the streets of Oslo obviously make much more money selling sex in Norway than in Italy and Spain even after the introduction of the law prohibiting the purchasing of sexual services.⁹³

This would also be the case in Stavanger as it has if not even better, than at least as high economic standards as Oslo. One might also add that there is little doubt that there is a lot of money flowing in the city of Stavanger due to the impact of the oil industry.

The customers cannot be ignored when discussing the complexity of the political arguments. It is already due to the realisation that there are many customers regardless of laws that prostitution is not criminal, because it would force people into vulnerable situations and little protection against violence and exploitation.

Despite police interventions there seems to be little effect in the larger picture in Norway and Europe. Flows, patterns and networks move and transform and reappear elsewhere, this was particularly the case the first six months after the introduction of the law prohibiting the purchase of sexual services. But the core issue still remained. The trafficking networks adapt to and eventually rely on the migration systems and policies on a pan-European level. This is a direct effect of the globalisation process that has led to a situation where one state cannot single-handedly deal with an issue on its own. Instead, states are dependent on cooperation with larger groups of states. Due to the increasing economic and political integration of European markets, trafficking networks now span the continent. The Schengen agreement is one of many political decisions that has significantly increased the necessary facilities of mobility. Although, this political process has led to the increase in span of trafficking networks across Europe, it has also led to increases in transnational prostitution networks which operate within legal frames. These networks, like internet-websites are often balancing on the fringes of law.

⁹³Prosenderet Oslo Kommune, "Prosenderet Årsrapport 2011," (Oslo 2012), p. 4-5

It is important to separate between the issues of trafficking and transnational prostitution, the latter of which happens in legal forms in Stavanger. The problems with the outdoor-market in Stavanger, like elsewhere, is that networks with criminal elements take advantage of the liberties created to make independence easier for all people. Prostitution is not the core issue, criminals that exploit people in the trafficking industry is the core problem.

The indoor market of Stavanger appears to be significantly different. The women here are better paid, work in better conditions and are more organised working intervals and tours. But does this kind of prostitution also constitute a problem in society?

In the following section I will present some of the main academic approaches to the discussion around whether or not prostitution is a 'social problem'.

There has been a significant debate over the links between prostitution and female exploitation in feminist literature since the 1960s. In the next section I will expand on the arguments of the different sides of the debate.

Approaches to Prostitution and Trafficking

There are many different academic approaches to the phenomenon of prostitution. The more traditional feminists argue that prostitution is inherently harmful and a breach of the integrity of the people involved. Other more radical and liberal feminists suggest that prostitution is a human right. In the book, *Prostitution and Feminism: Towards a Politics of Feeling*, the author Maggie O'Neill presents the two major feminist perspectives on prostitution. The first perspective, which I will refer to as the traditional feminist perspective, sees sex workers as exploited by those who manage and organize the sex industry. In this perspective, prostitution and the wider sex industry serve to underpin and reinforce prostitution as a patriarchal institution that affects all women and gendered relations. The second major feminist perspective, also called 'pro-sex-feminism', sees prostitution in the contemporary as a form of work which is freely chosen by many women, where women working in the sex industry deserve the same rights and liberties as other workers, including freedom from fear, exploitation and violence in the course of their work. It has also been argued that sex work or 'erotic labour' can be a "...liberatory terrain for women...".⁹⁴

In the article "Feminism, Marxism, Method, and the State: An Agenda for Theory", Catherine A. MacKinnon presents the traditional feminist perception of prostitution as an expression of male patriarchy and the male vision of sexuality.⁹⁵ MacKinnon sees prostitution not as primarily an abuse

⁹⁴Maggie O'Neill, *Prostitution and feminism: Towards a politics of feeling* (Oxford: Blackwell Publishers Ltd, 2001).

⁹⁵Catherine A MacKinnon, "Feminism, Marxism, method, and the state: An agenda for theory," *Signs* 7, no. 3 (1982): 533.

of physical force, violence, authority or economics, but rather as an abuse of sex. Mackinnon argues that prostitution (along with rape, pornography, sexual harassment and incest) is art and morality from the male point of view and that it expresses the relations, values, feelings, norms and behaviors of the culture's sexuality, in which prostitution (as well as pornography, rape, perversion etc.) is part of the 'excitement potential'.⁹⁶ Furthermore, MacKinnon questions the notions of sexual liberation of women, where she quotes Susan Sontag in asking "...what sexuality are women to be liberated to enjoy?"⁹⁷ The implication here is that sexual liberation will only equate to adopting the male sense of sexuality (under the premise that such a categorical male sexuality exists).

This argument is however disputed by many because it implies a universal male sexuality which uncompromisingly reverts the female body to a visual object and/or as an erotic tool. This form of 'male sexuality' undoubtedly exists, and one can argue, regrettably, that this is perhaps the dominant form of sexuality many places around the globe. But the problem is that this cannot be universally framed and codified to encompass all males. It is a distortion of reality to perpetuate such an argument, and it is also a form of discourse that brands the masculine as the notorious exploiter of female sexuality. Secondly, at present there is no empirical foundation for arguing that sexual objectification in public or in the media is exclusively rendered to the female body⁹⁸. In sharp contrast to this traditional form of feminist response to prostitution, the more recent conceptualizations of prostitution in feminist epistemology are more in line with what Maggie O'Neill describes as 'pro-sex-feminism'.

In the book *Prostitution Policy: Revolutionizing Practice Through a Gendered Perspective* the author Lenore Kuo presents the current feminist debate over prostitution in North America.⁹⁹ The argument that Kuo reaches suggests that the problem of prostitution is prostitution under patriarchy, and not prostitution in itself. She breaks with the feminist tradition that argues that if there were no patriarchy there would be no prostitution. Moreover, a significant part of Kuo's argument in this book is the rejection of the absolutes in the feminist debate over prostitution.¹⁰⁰ The reasons for rejecting these absolutes are according to Kuo that prostitution as a social phenomenon and the dynamics of the social practices are "...not only crushingly complex but also sufficiently diverse to make broad generalisations about individuals and policies of little use".¹⁰¹ Laura Agustin presents a different perception of prostitution from feminist epistemologies. Agustin particularly looks at prostitution from a labour migration perspective and focuses on the structures

⁹⁶Ibid., 532–533.

⁹⁷Ibid., 533–534.

⁹⁸On the contrary the male body is also highly sexualised in western popular culture.

⁹⁹Lenore Kuo, *Prostitution policy: revolutionizing practice through a gendered perspective* (New York: New York University Press, 2005), 138.

¹⁰⁰Ibid., 138–139.

¹⁰¹Ibid., 7.

that force migrant women to turn to the sex trade. Agustín analysed trafficking in a pan-European perspective. What is most striking about the conclusion reached by Agustín is that feminists of all stripes are implicated in the assumption of 'knowing best' and having a duty to find 'proper' solutions to alter the situations of 'others'. Her critique does not imply that there are no social injustices, but rather implies the constructed character of 'social problems'. The focus is not on *paternalistic* obsessions with how or how not to deal with this issue, but rather an understanding that prostitution is a diversified phenomenon where victimising those involved amounts to disempowerment.¹⁰²

There are many findings in previous empirical studies that shed light over these arguments. In the following some of the major studies on prostitution in Norway are presented.

Empirical Studies in Norway

In the report *Crossing Borders: An Empirical Study of Transnational Prostitution and Trafficking in Human Beings*, Guri Tyldum and Annette Brunovskis investigate the connections between migration, trafficking and prostitution.¹⁰³ In this study the authors looked at transnational prostitution and trafficking in human beings, the study was based on interviews with victims of trafficking. In this study the authors found that in October of 2003, there were approximately 600 women working in prostitution in Oslo, the authors also found that there was a high turnover of migrant women coming to Oslo to work in prostitution and they estimate that the total number of women working in prostitution in Oslo in 2003 was approximately 1100, where 79 percent were of 'non-Norwegian origin'.¹⁰⁴ Of the group 'non-Norwegian origin' they found that approximately half were permanent residents in Norway. The authors also found that there has been an increase in transnational prostitution in the prostitution market in Oslo. They identified a sharp increase in migrant women from eastern- and southern-Europe around the year 2000.¹⁰⁵ One of the main points which the authors of this study emphasized was that the women working in prostitution in Norway at the time in no way constituted a homogeneous group. There was a high degree of variation in the ways they worked, the reasons for working, their social backgrounds, age and levels of education.¹⁰⁶ The authors found that there were few stories of women being physically taken from their country of origin against their will, mostly the victims welcomed what seemed to be an opportunity for

102Agustín, 2007

103Annette Brunovskis and Guri Tyldum, *Crossing borders: an empirical study of transnational prostitution and trafficking in human beings* (Interface Media Norway: Fafo, 2004).

104Ibid., 27.

105Ibid., 17.

106Ibid., 21.

marriage or employment or to avoid prosecution or economic insecurity. Many of them realized too late that the conditions of 'work' promised to them were not as they had expected.¹⁰⁷ They also found that the tendency was that most of the trafficked women were initially recruited or aided by people whom they knew and trusted. They also found that physical (violent) force was not the most prevalent means of control of the women once in Norway, the main tendency was manipulation, threats and using whatever mistrust the women had towards the police (in their country of origin) to actively discourage them from seeking help. They also found that the women from eastern and southern Europe extensively required help in order to establish themselves in the prostitution market in Oslo.¹⁰⁸

One of the main empirical studies that focuses on teenage prostitution in Norway is the Nova (Norwegian Social Research Institute) report "Sex for Survival or shadow-images of love?: Teenagers under 18 that sell sexual services" from 2002.¹⁰⁹ This report includes extensive qualitative (interviews) and quantitative (surveys) studies of teenage prostitution in the Oslo area. What is particularly interesting about this report is that it specifically looks into whether the prostitution is voluntary, forced or coerced and how the choice of prostitution is made. Another important element in this study is the inclusion of male prostitution. In this study which is based on a representative survey of 12.000 teenagers in the Oslo-area, the authors found that 2.1 percent of the males and 0.6 percent of the females had 'performed sexual services for payment'. The average age of debut was 13.5 years for the males and 14.1 years for the females. Of the teenagers that had sold sexual services during the previous year, one third had sold sexual services 1-3 times while over half had sold sexual services more than 10 times. The authors found that the term *survival sex* was the most fitting conceptual tool for discussing teenage prostitution in Oslo. The term 'survival sex' refers to the sale or exchange of sexual services for drugs, money for drugs, food, shelter or other benefits in order to manage and get through difficult times.¹¹⁰ The authors of this study have assumed that in most cases the customers are mainly male.¹¹¹

In the report "Trafficking in Women – Fact-Finding Trip to Nigeria" Geir Skogseth found that when approximately 20 percent of the women working in prostitution in Norway were from Nigeria (in 2006).¹¹² furthermore, most of the Nigerian women working in the prostitution market had been living in Europe for a number of years. Skogseth also emphasises the worrying development where Nigerian women are being trafficked directly from Nigeria to Norway. Skogseth found that the

107Ibid., 22.

108Ibid.

109K. Hegna and W. Pedersen, "Sex for overlevelse eller skyggebilder av kjaerlighet," *NOVA rapport 5* (2002).

110Ibid., 7.

111Ibid., 8.

112Geir Skogseth, *Trafficking in Women–Fact-finding trip to Nigeria (Abuja, Lagos and Benin City) 12-26 March 2006* (Oslo: Landinfo - The country of Origin Information Center, 2006).

Nigerian women involved in prostitution in Norway appear to have little connection with Norway's established Nigerian community or with Nigerian asylum seekers. In this article Skogseth concludes that the Nigerian human trafficking industry is shaped by four deciding factors. Firstly, without a market for their services, no Nigerian women would end up working as prostitutes in European countries. Secondly, the structure of Nigerian criminal networks makes them notoriously difficult to break up. Particularly relevant are the *madams* who are primary exploiters of female Nigerian trafficking victims. Thirdly, poor and unskilled Nigerians are particularly vulnerable to exploitation because they have limited opportunities to migrate to Europe legally. Finally, many Nigerian trafficking victims have had mixed or negative experiences in dealing with the authorities in European countries. In addition they generally have very little confidence in Nigerian authorities which makes it difficult to build trust between victims and organisations designed to help them and to combat the problem.¹¹³

State Dilemmas

In relation to the phenomenon of prostitution, liberal European states are torn between sets of mutually exclusive arguments and principles. In the Norwegian case the 'state dilemma' is torn between the a moral cost and a human cost. The state wishes to uphold a principle that it does not condone the sale of humans in any form. On the other hand legislation must not place vulnerable groups at greater risk. There is a similar debate surrounding the legalisation of illegal narcotics. The arguments range between abolishments and criminalisation on one side and complete legalisation and state regulation on the other.

On the one hand the state does not stand for the values that permit open support for this kind of activity. On the other hand it cannot avoid seeing the human cost involved in the criminalisation. Criminalisation leads to insecure conditions for the people involved and ultimately leads to financial support for criminal networks. The core issue seen from the perspective of the state is between paying either the principle cost or the human cost.

In the next chapter I will connect and discuss the material presented so far, drawing theory and findings together, and discuss the key aspects and problems involved in prostitution as a migrant activity in the contemporary.

¹¹³Ibid., 6–7.

The Securitisation of Migration

The case of the Nigerian women working in prostitution in Europe is one among many issues of migration which increasingly is being discussed as a legislative immigration issue. Migration has become one of the most central topics in European politics, recurring regularly as an intensely debated topic during election periods across Europe. Over the past decade there has been a marked shift towards the political right in much of western and southern Europe. The far right, often dubbed extreme, parties like the British National Party in the UK, Front National in France and Sverige demokraterne in Sweden have in the recent years significantly increased in size and are moving into a position where they can gain a significant amount of votes in elections by largely focusing their political rhetoric on immigration and the perceived threat posed by migrants. However, it is not merely the smaller far-right parties of Europe who are moving towards a more restrictive position on migration. EU policies such as the Dublin regulation are leading to a new face of Europe often entitled “fortress Europe”. The agreement which was intended to standardize regulations on asylum-seekers and so-called “illegal migrants” has led to a situation where Southern and Eastern Europe are becoming the frontier zones of European immigration. More worryingly, as Matthew J. Gibney argues in the book *The Ethics and Politics of Asylum: Liberal Democracy and the Response to Refugees*, refugees and asylum-seekers are increasingly being excluded from the western societies by interdiction, that is the prevention of migrants from ever reaching jurisdiction in which they have legal rights to apply for asylum¹¹⁴.

However, it is not merely migrations into Europe which are becoming highly politicized, also internally in the Schengen area there are certain groups who are being politicized as a threat, among others the Roma people. It is particularly the Roma from Romania and Bulgaria who have in recent years become politically labeled as a serious “social problem” in many European states, most notably in France and Italy where mass expulsions of Roma have taken place¹¹⁵. Another important aspect of the increased attention and restrictive stance on immigration in Europe is the perceived threat of Islam and the increasing tendency of Islamophobia, which dramatically increased after the 2001 World Trade center attacks, can be found throughout European politics.

In the present, “security” as seen by the modern state does not simply refer to ideological or military threats, it is being discursively increased in scope to include migration, ethnic and religious revivals, identity claims and supranational entities¹¹⁶. These issues are becoming “securitized” and

114 Matthew J. Gibney, *The Ethics and Politics of Asylum: Liberal Democracy and the Response to Refugees* (Cambridge Univ. Press, 2004), 129-130, 190-193.

115 Liz Fekete, *A suitable enemy: Racism, migration and Islamophobia in Europe* (London: Pluto Press, 2009), 5.

116 Ayhan Kaya, *Islam, Migration and Integration: The Age of Securitization* (New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009), 8.

as Jeff Huysmans describes it

“It is likely that modern states tend to employ the discourse of securitization as a political technique that can integrate a society by staging a credible existential threat in the form of an internal, or even external, enemy, an enemy that is created by security agencies (like the police and the army) by categorizing migration together with drug trafficking, human trafficking, criminality and terrorism”¹¹⁷

Ayhan Kaya writes in *Islam, Migration and Integration; the Age of Securitization* that the public perception of migration as the principal source of present disorder masks the actual causes of the globalized social-political discontent¹¹⁸. In this context the discursive criminalization of migrants, focusing on aspects of criminal activity, or the inherent criminalization of “illegal migration” is an inextricable constituent of the securitization of migration.

Liz Fekete writes that at present the issue of foreign criminality is peddled freely by nearly all political parties, particularly at election times. Furthermore, Fekete argues that the mainstreaming of the “foreigner/criminal equation” was greatly aided throughout the 1990s by the way in which police, interior ministries and right-wing political think-tanks issued dubious, unscientific and racialized crime statistics that purported to show how European societies were under threat from immigrant crime waves as well as duplicitous asylum seekers. According to Fekete this is exacerbated by the vested interests which the sensationalist media have in perpetuating the notion that crime and immigration are out of control in order to sell their news.¹¹⁹

However, it is not simply the case that the European media are one-sided and collectively portray an image contributing to the securitization of migration, rather the situation is more complex and there is a distinct competition of discourses on the issue of immigration and the supposed threats.

Huysmans writes about what he defines as the distribution of fear and insecurity in politics and argues that the politics of insecurity

“...is a struggle between competing understandings of a phenomenon. Are immigrants and refugees an economic resource for a country? Are they a danger to social stability? Are refugees human rights holders who have a right to be protected under international law? Are immigrants and refugees a real or perceived danger to society?” (these questions) “...emerge in a struggle over which interpretation and thus which kind of knowledge should inform migration policy”¹²⁰

Asylum seekers are particularly becoming equated with a inherent threat to society, they are no

¹¹⁷Ibid. see quote of Jeff Huysmans (1998, 2006) p.8

¹¹⁸Ibid.

¹¹⁹Fekete, (2009).

¹²⁰Jeff Huysmans, *The politics of insecurity: fear, migration and asylum in the EU* (London, New York: Routledge, 2006), 53.

longer seen as those in need of protection from threats, the logic of status has to a certain extent been turned on its head. Although it is often correctly observed that many migrants are not entitled to asylum protection but still use the “guise” of asylum in order to gain access to Europe, the situation of people in need of asylum has not become lowered in scope over the past two decades. Quite the contrary is the case, and in fact due to the global policies and actions taken by western governments in the past two decades many have correctly argued that the increase in asylum-seekers is a direct result of European and American actions and policies in the global context. According to Fekete, the European governments have created what she defines as a “suitable enemy”, an enemy which can serve the purpose of creating a sufficient threat which will allow for significant changes in policy and a more rightist direction of European politics¹²¹.

The major problem with the immigration debate in European politics is that it does not go to the core issues that create the inward flows of migration to Europe. This is particularly the case with the Nigerian women. Trying to get them out or getting them out of sight from the voting public would not change the outflows from Nigeria, it is likely that they would simply go elsewhere and endure worse conditions. The major challenge of the international community is to help Nigerian officials tackle the networks and recruitment of women for exploitation in Europe. Securitization of migration policies is not a constructive option, it is simply pushing responsibility off from European hands and onto developing states elsewhere, which far more often are politically and economically unstable.

121Fekete, (2009)

5. Global markets

In this chapter I will draw on the material from the preceding chapters in order to comprehensively analyse the workings of the contemporary urban prostitution markets of Norway. In this chapter I intend to connect theory to empirical findings. The main argument is that contemporary urban prostitution markets in Norway display typical characteristics and factors of international migration theories and occur within the context of modern intensification of global interconnection.

Globalisation is a critical aspect of explaining the current tendencies in the Norwegian prostitution markets. The market would not be composed the way it is at present without the increasing global transformations that intensify global interconnection. Women can now move from Nigeria to Stavanger within a 24 hour period, effectively making it within “commuting distance”. The geographical distance may be large, but temporally and practically the distance is not great whatsoever. Comparing to a century ago, the distance from Lagos to Oslo today is practically many times shorter than Stavanger to Oslo was before the Southern Norwegian railway was completed in 1905.

In the following section I will expand on the similarities and differences between the two markets in contemporary urban Norwegian prostitution, before illustrating how both of these markets display typical characteristics of international migration and globalisation.

Mobility and Migration Patterns

Modern prostitution in Norway is as previously mentioned split into two different types of market (indoor/outdoor), yet in both of these markets migration and *mobility* are key elements. There are certain typical patterns which seem to occur in both of these two markets. One of the main tendencies is urban to urban mobility. In both of these markets the service providers tend to travel between the largest Norwegian cities. The tendency of 'touring' through Norwegian cities at intervals is most prevalent in the indoor-market.

The Nigerian migrant women on the outdoor market of Stavanger travel extensively, however, it seems like they are first and foremost connected to other cities in continental Europe, notably Italy and Spain, and secondly to other Norwegian cities. One of the most significant findings from the

fieldwork for this thesis was learning how important mobility and the frequency of travels were among the Nigerian women in the outdoor market. Many of the 'familiar' faces from the outdoor market very often disappeared from Stavanger for a matter of weeks or months before returning again, eagerly talking about their travels to other cities and countries. There are also many indications that many of these women travel regularly back and forth between Nigeria and European countries. It seems that regardless of purposes, mobility is a key element. Mobility, and not necessarily migration (i.e. crossing international borders and staying for longer periods of time) is perhaps the biggest similarity between the two prostitution markets in Norway from an overall perspective, while the outdoor markets of Norway (particularly Stavanger) appear to be defined by international migrations for longer periods of time (mostly in the range of 3-12 months).

Few if any at all of the Nigerian women in the outdoor market of Stavanger have come directly to Norway from Nigeria. Most of the women appear to have been in either Italy or Spain for longer periods before coming to Stavanger. This kind of 'chain'-migration pattern, involving several stages, is typical for Nigerian migrant women who work in the outdoor market of Stavanger.

It seems that in the indoor-market it is more common to have circular migration patterns which follow intervals in a similar fashion to seasonal work.

The Global Marketplace

Both with regards to the indoor and outdoor markets of contemporary urban Norway, we may describe prostitution as being a part of a global labour market. Wage-differentials are important both in a regional perspective and in a global perspective. Yet, simultaneously, wage-differentials are far from the sole explanation of the dynamics of modern global labour markets.

In the indoor market it seems that wage differentials do play a significant role in explaining why Norway in particular has such a high number of migrants in the indoor-market. Furthermore, due to the intensification of the European economic integration the facilities of migration are in place to allow people to, quickly and with relative ease, exploit the differences between labour-markets.

The globalisation of information has meant that people all around the world become aware of the ways and standards of life in other parts of the world. This information may be accurate or it may be deeply flawed, no matter the case, it means that people are more or less aware of what things are like in other places, or simply that things are different in other places. This is the premise for what is known as *relative deprivation*.

In the case of Nigerian migrant women it is likely that *relative deprivation* is not merely related to differences in wages. Wages are not the only factor relevant in explaining the concept of relative deprivation. It may just as well be economic stability in terms of inflation and access to foodstuffs and other commodities. It may just as easily be political stability and personal security which these women feel deprived of. Furthermore, the shortcomings of the Nigerian state in terms of endemic corruption is highly likely to be a significant factor as well. Given that the Nigerian society as a whole is, generally speaking, informed (accurately or not) about the workings of societies in the highly developed countries, it is far from surprising that feelings of relative deprivation may arise. At present this argument is a qualified speculation and requires further empirical studies to determine the extent. However, in the opinion of this author it is not a matter of whether or not relative deprivation plays a role, but rather to what extent it is important. This is because it is the most reasonable explanation for the aforementioned 'get-rich-quickly syndrome' which Achebe describes.

The fact that migrants are coming to Norway to work in the prostitution markets may well be explained by Piore's idea that highly developed countries are inherently in need of migrants to fill jobs which the native population is unwilling to take. In the case of Norway it is safe to say that there does exist a hierarchy in the employment market. There are jobs which the native population increasingly is becoming unwilling to take. One such area is the cleaning business, which increasingly is being executed by migrants. Although there is little question of the importance of this business it still seems to be an area of employment which is seen as dirty, demeaning and at times dangerous. Besides the fact that this is a critically important profession (Norwegian society would quickly grind to a halt without it), it is arguably a profession at the lowest end of the Norwegian employment hierarchy. According to Piore's theory on international migration it is jobs such as the cleaning business that require migrants because the native population is increasingly unwilling to work in 'dangerous, dirty or demeaning' conditions, which one might argue that the cleaning business represents. Piore's point is that the case is different for migrants because according to his theory, migrants are not so much focused on their status in the country of destination as they are on their status in the country of origin. In other words one might say that many migrants often do not care what they do in Norway because it is the social status in their country of origin that matters. And what is important is not that they may be working as a cleaner in Norway, but rather that they have successfully migrated and are making more money than they ever could dream of in their country of origin. Furthermore, they may also have secured for their children a solid education in a welfare state, not to mention all other kinds of benefits that entail

living in a highly developed country. In other words, they do not care what they are doing in the country of destinations because the sheer increase in living standards and social security makes for a high social status in the country of origin.

And this is precisely what I argue is the case with the Norwegian prostitution markets. This is the reason why prostitution in Norway is increasingly becoming a profession which is being filled by migrants.

This tendency is what I will refer to as the *modern global division of labour*, and it would not exist without globalisation processes as a premise. Furthermore, for the Nigerian women on the streets of Stavanger it is more than likely that they are far more concerned with their social status in Nigeria than in Norway.

The Perceived Insecurity

As mentioned in chapter 2, many researchers have written that one of the biggest challenges of societies face in relation to many of the adverse effects of globalisation processes is the perceived insecurity. When politicians and policies fail to correctly address social problems, it is often far easier to explain to the voters that this is a negative side of globalisation rather than a failed political choice. Like in the case of Norway, instead of working to bolster Nigerian anti-corruption agencies, or to work for international solutions to this issue, politicians instead think in terms of criminalisation and morality. It has become typical of European governments to participate in creating complex problems and rejecting to take responsibility for it and instead deal with it through the 'criminal lense'.

It is beyond doubt that the IMF through its structural adjustment programmes (SAP's) was one of the initial catalysts of the phenomenon of Nigerian trafficking for purposes of sexual exploitation. Because of these programmes the local agricultural economy completely fell apart in the early 1980s. For a largely agricultural economy that meant the uprooting of millions of Nigerians who no longer had any means for survival. Leaving for Europe to sell sex on the streets is not a difficult choice to make in the face of hunger or endemic unemployment.

What is more, the IMF is largely owned and run by European governments, many of whom now are trying to rid themselves of what they see as profit-driven Africans in the sex trade and completely disregard their own responsibility in creating this situation in the first place. Norway is also a part of this and by thinking in terms of criminalisation they are merely treating the problem symptomatically rather than dealing with the core issues of unemployment, lacking opportunities

and endemic corruption in Nigeria.

One might ask what would be the reality for the women in question if they were forced out of Norway? It is highly unrealistic to believe that it would solve the problem, on the contrary it would move the problem to other places where conditions are worse and the protection from violent customers currently endured in Norway would by no means be certain any more.

Perceived insecurity is also one of the biggest challenges to getting a more balanced political debate. The same goes for the media discourses, who thrive on discourses of the 'threatening', 'aggressive' prostitutes that threaten to undermine the moral 'integrity' of Norwegian men who have been unfortunate enough to get one to many beers on their trip to town. In fact there are so many levels of failure and wrongness in the dominant discourses that are being perpetuated that it is even difficult to think we are even talking about the same topic.

Instead of talking about the real problems which is exploitation and desperation the local debate revolves around 'aesthetics' and 'morality'. There are few others ways of describing this than egocentricity and the refusal to see things from the perspective of the other.

At the heart of the problem from the point of the local population is as Skilbrei wrote that these are the 'wrong people in the wrong places'. They 'pollute', as Mary Douglas defines it, the image which the local population have of their own city and criminalisation is one of the only feasible ways of getting anything done in the short term perspective. Judging from the articles on the topic in the local newspapers it seems to be of little or no concern to the local population what would happen to the women on the streets if criminalisation came into being.

What is at the heart of the problem is that people want this to be matters out of sight, other than a few hardcore traditional feminists such as the local feminist group 'Ottar' few if any discuss getting rid of indoor prostitution. It is well worth questioning why it is just so.

Furthermore, it is more than reasonable to argue that frankly the local politicians have no idea what to do in order to deal with the origins of the problem. Sitting in Stavanger with no more than local authority it is hard if not seemingly impossible to do anything about unemployment, education and corruption in another country that has more than thirty times the population of Norway.

This is one of the sides of the *perceived insecurity* which the globalisation process has brought into being. I argue that the law which criminalises the purchasing of sexual services of 2009 was an example of this perceived insecurity in that it was trying to get things out of the sight of the politos, i.e. the voting population. It was not an actual attempt at doing anything with the core issues, and

therefore it was doomed to failure from the very onset.

Final Discussions

From a local point of view the topic of prostitution is largely dominated by the more uninformed populist perspectives on the “visible” prostitution and not on the deeper issue of trafficking and exploitation. The perception that the topic is a matter of inner city aesthetics is strikingly common. And it is because of this that the situation has turned into a stalemate, where prostitution is in a state of legal limbo and there appears to be a total vacuum of action.

At the same time those who are willing to stand up for the deeper issue are faced with an impossible task. It has rendered local authorities and organisations unable to do anything but symptomatic treatment. The origin of the problem is still not being dealt with and therefore any action will fail to address the root causes.

The span of the problem is intercontinental and at the heart of the issue lies problems related to economic development, hyper-population growth and unemployment in Nigeria along with a state structure widely held to be endemically corrupt.

Street-prostitution in Stavanger continues and even shows signs of a slight increase since I first started following the developments in 2009. During this period three different detectives at the local police station have had the job of working with investigating the criminal networks behind, suggesting that it has not been an attractive position to fill, possibly due to the difficulties they have been faced with in translating street-realities into court convictions. As earlier mentioned the Nigerian networks have become infamous for being difficult to investigate, partially due to the psychological grip which juju-rituals inflict on those who travel to Europe. An important part of the story to bear in mind here is that in order to convict without witness testimony it requires an enormous use of resources in gathering phone data and tracking money transfers and so on. Even if this kind of evidence has been gathered there is no guarantee that it will convict.

It is well known among people who work with the issue that victims of trafficking from Nigeria rarely give up their traffickers. It is also well known that the police most of the time only actively investigate cases where they believe it will end in a court conviction. Due to this fact most of what goes on within the networks that operate in Stavanger remains concealed from the public.

It is because of these reasons that the networks continue to operate so freely in Europe.

It is a paradox that this continues to happen in a country that prides itself on egalitarian principles of decency. It is my opinion that this is a significant stain on the pride of the social-democratic state.

Migrant Networks

The Nigerian networks are not markedly different from other globalised migrant communities with regards to the flow of information and resources between sending and receiving countries.

Compared to the theoretical work on international migration the migrant prostitution in Stavanger is no new conceptual phenomenon. It may easily be described as a result of the inherent demand for people to fill the 3D-jobs (dirty, demeaning and dangerous) that increasingly depends on migrant labour because the local population is unwilling to do this work.

However, what seems evident in these flows of migrants is that they appear to be temporally finite. Roughly speaking most of the women seem to be in Stavanger on a temporary basis and intend to go home after having accumulated enough money. Whether or not they will end up better off than when they left Nigeria is hard to answer. Some of the informants I have spoken to suggest that most of the women are working towards the goal of a comfortable retirement, but how realistic this is cannot be estimated at the moment. Some of the women suggested that it is common that retired prostitutes in Nigeria live comfortably in wealthy neighbourhoods and can send their children to good schools. If this is true or not is hard to say without actually going to Nigeria to investigate. However, it may well be an illusion created by their traffickers in order to strengthen the incentives in the recruitment stage. After all this does not seem an unlikely bait given Nwando Achebe's theory that there is a collective "get-rich-quickly-syndrome" in place in Nigeria.

Relative deprivation seems to be a significant factor in explaining the persistence of the phenomenon. Moreover, for each person that leaves it is likely that the process of travelling to Europe becomes ever more glorified and a negative spiral comes into effect. Seeing that it has become a symbol of status to send ones children to Europe there seems to be no reprieve in the recruitment stage.

Unravelling the Networks

As previously mentioned one cannot understate the importance of networks in these flows. Without established networks these flows would not be able to flourish. Once in place they function much in the same way as other migrant networks do as far as cross-border contact and social capital goes (limited though it may be in comparison to other groups).

But exactly how these networks were established is not easy to answer. After the first few Nigerian women came to Stavanger after 2004 it did not take long before many more followed. This is also the case for the other Norwegian cities such as Oslo and Bergen. That this establishment coincided

with the latest expansions of the Schengen area cannot be seen as a mere coincidence. The most likely explanation for this is that Nigerian trafficking networks were already established in continental Europe before 2004 and therefore the establishment of networks in Norwegian cities must be seen as extensions of larger and longer standing networks in continental Europe.

It is also because of these aspects that I will argue that local action against the criminal elements in these networks, although clearly necessary, will merely be symptomatic treatment, because it is highly likely that the people who “pull the strings” and who benefit from the trafficking flows are not present in Norway.

It is important to note that there is some international cooperation on the matter. One of my sources in the local police department has underlined that Europol and Interpol are involved in investigations dealing with Nigerian trafficking networks. However, the problem is that these cases rarely reach the top priorities over other international organised criminal networks.

The focus of the local police is of a different character than the kind of action which I would see as necessary to get to the root of the problem. I have been informed that unless the police are willing to go into the “small cases” where the focus is helping the individuals who are suffering, it would be tantamount to a declaration of fallacy. It is not that I disagree with this point of view, but what I believe is wrong with this angle of approach is that it will not stop young women from being trafficked to Europe in the first place. This is more of an aid to those who already are heavily indebted and unable to exit. It is not an effective prevention of the root problem.

Trafficking of women to Europe from Nigeria is a highly profitable venture for those involved. Although the victims appear to be those that profit the least from the trade, it appears that there are many benefactors to the continuation of trafficking.¹²²

As earlier mentioned there is reason to argue that there is resistance within the Nigerian state structure to take action against trafficking. Okojie et al. write that within Edo state (one of the Nigerian states) there exists a government authorized structure of extortion.¹²³ Combined with the fact that a majority of the women who are trafficked to Norway come from Edo state it becomes obvious that action is largely futile until action within the government structures is taken.

Questions for Further Studies

During my work with this thesis there were many questions that I identified as good topics for further studies which I did not have the capacity or means to investigate myself.

Many of these topics are related to concrete details which I was not able to find any data on. One of

¹²²Christina E.E. Okojie, “International Trafficking of Women for The Purpose of Sexual Exploitation and Prostitution. The Nigerian Case,” *Pakistan Journal of Women’s Studies: Alam-e-Niswan* 16, no. 1&2 (2009): 162.

¹²³Ibid., 159.

these topics is the exactly how money flows in these networks. The flow of information is not too difficult to explain given the telecommunication technologies of today. Because of mobile technology and the prices of communication across national boundaries in recent years¹²⁴ the women on the streets of Stavanger are only touches away from direct communication with networks in Nigeria.

But the flow of money is more difficult to explain. Due to Norwegian financial legislation any transfer or transaction over 10.000,- NOK must be registered to tax authorities. However, money must still be flowing otherwise there would logically be signs of a decrease in activity, yet the opposite is happening. Where is the money going and how does it leave the country?

It has been well-known that the trafficking networks use the established channels of money transactions (e.g. Western Union) along with other more informal channels including illicit curers. Yet, the extent of the flows in these channels is unknown. Okojie et al. have written about how large sums flow into Edo state annually through Western Union and how this banking union makes huge profits from the money transactions that stem from the earnings of street-prostitution in Europe. This is still an undocumented side of the story which could possibly give a great insight into exactly how these networks are organised.

Obviously, getting insight into these transactions would require the transparency of transactions going in and out of Edo state, which given privacy legislation, seems impossible at the moment. However, it may be one of the few ways to actually get a breakthrough with regards to tracking down these networks. After all it is not without reason that Okojie et al. argue that Western Union is the worlds most patronised outfit of traffickers and victims alike.¹²⁵

How travel documentation and work permits are obtained is also an important detail in explaining the concrete workings of the trafficking into Europe from Nigeria. Several questions need to be answered to find an answer to this; what are the concrete documents they obtain? What role does corruption and/or forgery play in the process of obtaining travel documentation? What role do European embassies in Nigeria play in this?

Since 2008 Europe has been rocked by a series of economic challenges resulting in a crisis in southern Europe. It has been obvious to the organisations that work with the topic that prostitution in Norway has been affected by the unfolding situation in southern Europe. But exactly what effects it has had on the prostitution market of northern Europe is still largely unknown. It has been suggested that many people working in prostitution in southern Europe have moved north in the search for better paying customers. But to what extent has this affected the Norwegian market?

¹²⁴Note companies such as Lebara specialising in low fares in intercontinental calls.

¹²⁵Okojie, "International Trafficking of Women for The Purpose of Sexual Exploitation and Prostitution. The Nigerian Case," 162.

A Social Problem

After having worked with the topic of migrant prostitution in Stavanger over several years now it has become evident that it is not migrant prostitution per se that is problematic. It is rather the fact that the majority of the street-workers have either by force, coercion or fraud been lured into prostitution. Migrant prostitution in Stavanger is not exclusively a result of criminal networks working to profit from the young and ignorant, there are many independent migrants whom make a living from prostitution without being exploited by criminal elements.

However, there is sufficient reason to argue that street-prostitution in Stavanger mostly is conducted by women who currently are in or previously have been in some form of debt-bondage.

But, a significant obstacle to actually doing something about the problem is that the local population does not consider the exploitation of the migrant prostitutes to be the major issue. It is the “visible” prostitution that stirs the most attention in the local debate. The debate continues to revolve around inner city aesthetics and notions of “aggressive prostitution”. The Nigerian prostitution is grouped along with other issues relating to the aesthetics of Stavanger, such as organised begging by Roma migrants. The debate has become entrenched by the notion that the “wrong kind” of migrants are “polluting” public areas. The migration debate with regards to these groups is not considered in the same way as other forms of migration to the Stavanger region, normally welcomed with open arms due to labour-shortages, quite to the contrary migrant prostitution has become a securitized debate and the women involved have increasingly been seen as threats to the moral fabric of Norwegian society rather than victims that continue to be exploited.

The debate in the local context of Stavanger has become completely sidetracked by notions of morality and constructed social threats. The focus is not on the exploited, rather the exploited have become framed and coded as threats. The social reality that has been constructed is a populist and shallow vision that has been created mainly by the local media (heavily influenced by discourses in national media) for purposes of profit. Sensationalist headlines and sound bites that sell papers and give website hits has been the driving force behind the construction of Nigerian women as a threat to the well-being of the local community.

The construction of migrant prostitution in Stavanger as a threat to the community is in my opinion one of the biggest obstacles to getting to the root causes of the issue. However, although there is the discursive obstacle to achieving any support for action to aid this group, there is also the staggering task of actually getting anything done about it. The previously presented argument by Hylland-

Eriksen that globalisation brings with it an increase in “perceived insecurity”¹²⁶ is strikingly relevant. Given that steps have to be taken in another continent to actually do something about the trafficking flows to Europe renders people willing to make stand with a sense of complete futility.

From the perspective of the locals, what can one actually do or hope to achieve?

Idealism can go far, yet one cannot avoid facing the hard reality of endemic corruption and lacking development in Nigeria along with the lack of will in Europe to work collectively and effectively towards a resolution. Faced with such obstacles, what can one do?

Grass roots campaigns have been worth while, yet this requires massive support for the cause, which in the current discursive climate is highly unlikely. A total change of perspective in the debate seems a necessary prerequisite.

Matters out of Sight

It has become obvious through the work I have done leading to this thesis that the law prohibiting the purchasing of sexual services has been an attempt at getting matters out of sight. I will argue that there is significant reason to argue that the work of Mary Douglas on pollution is transferable to the context of the introduction of the said law.¹²⁷

It is safe to assume that the law prohibiting the purchase of sexual services was a direct result of the attention and visibility of women from Nigeria working on Norwegian streets. The point being that prostitution had been legally accepted before this in order to protect the people involved from harassment, violence or exploitation. The new law of 2009 had the purpose of getting prostitution out of sight by playing on the fact that customers now have to be discrete. Although there was some initial success to this law, the situation (at least in Stavanger) is back to the same level activity if not higher in the prostitution market. Therefore it is fitting to describe this as an attempt to get matters out of sight, and reject the argument that it is an attempt at reinforcing work against the criminal and corrupt elements behind this form of trafficking network. The latter argument has been launched as the reason d'etre of this legislation, however, the author of this thesis will strongly reject the notion that it was a mere coincidence that this law was introduced at the same time as attention to Nigerian prostitution in Norwegian media was at its highest point.

¹²⁶Thomas Hylland Eriksen, (2007), 127.

¹²⁷Mary Douglas, (2001)

6. Conclusion

It is due to the persistent work of *Albertine Prosjektet* that the outdoor-market of Stavanger is relatively transparent. The work of this organisation has shown that migration now lies at the very centre of the issue of prostitution in Stavanger.

The analyses in this thesis are complex and include a vast number of factors that intersect. It is obvious that any analyses must also take into account factors in the country of origin, particularly with regards to the Nigerian trafficking networks. It is not possible to comprehensively understand these networks and flows without taking into account the factors in Nigeria.

There many factors that are important to include in an analysis of the Nigerian trafficking networks. Number one is that psychological control is a key to understanding the Nigerian trafficking networks. Furthermore, the dream of reaching Europe and creating a better economic future is likely to be one of the most central motivators in the recruitment stage. Along with what Achebe describes as a “get-rich-quickly-syndrom” in Nigeria we can begin to understand why many young Nigerian women knowingly are willing to become international prostitutes. It is also evident that the endemic corruption of the Nigerian state is a crucial factor in explaining why this trend has continued to expand over the past two decades. It is clear that many of the internal issues in the Nigerian state are contributing factors in explaining how this form of migration has become an internalised part of the prospects of many Nigerian women. It is also clear that the ideal-victim typology does not fit the women involved in Nigerian trafficking networks.

The placeless logic

The flows and networks described in this thesis follow a placeless logic, constantly transforming and adapting to local changes and events. This also results in bigger challenges in making steadfast conclusions. Generalisations are difficult to make, and are perhaps even more difficult to adequately employ.

The prostitution market in the case of Stavanger is defined by two highly differing markets. Yet they represent a typical marketplace in the global economy. It is clear that it is demand that is the main driving factor behind.

People have come to be commodities on the global market. The prostitution markets of Stavanger draws on a global labour market that for the time being particularly exploits the excess labour

supplies in Africa.

Migration is not purely economics, yet the motivation for the migrations described in this thesis are likely to have an almost purely economic factor driving the people involved. Be it directly or indirectly, money is the key to the game.

Globalisation is not the cause of trafficking or prostitution, but nevertheless, globalisation processes often serve to facilitate the expansion and perpetuation of trafficking and prostitution. The global increase in trafficking and international prostitution over the past decades must be seen as a by-product of the increasing global economic integration processes over the past decades. It is as earlier mentioned impossible to totally control all flows that cross international borders without significantly slowing down activity. Achieving results must happen in other ways than by total control.

Similarly, transnational trends, is an inherent part of globalisation processes. Transnational prostitution utilizes the facilities of transnational networks. Communication technologies and the internet is integral to understanding the modern indoor-market. We live in a world that still is dominated by the national logic, this is exploited by trafficking networks and transnational prostitution facilitators alike. A prime example of this is the internet websites that “flag out” to countries where legislation does not inhibit advertising prostitution services. By moving servers to countries with more amiable legislation, the facilitators of high-end prostitution exploit the diverging legal geographies. This is done in much the same manner Norwegian internet betting companies.

The local discourse

Three years after the law prohibiting the purchasing of sexual services there is an increasing realisation that not much has changed since the introduction of the law. In the opinion of the author the debate has completely lost track of the deeper underlying issues. Notions of “wrongness” dominate the local discourse on prostitution. Instead of being the focus for a fight against international exploitation of migrants, the debate instead focuses on vice and has framed the exploited women as threats to the moral fabric of local community. A social reality has been constructed where these women have come to be seen as aggressive threats. Aggression rather than desperation has become the most common description. This illustrates the wider phenomenon where migrants increasingly are being seen as security issues. It is a worrying tendency that seems detrimental to resolving the issue.

Theory

Many concepts from the theoretical work on globalisation are applicable to the analysis of the prostitution market in Stavanger. Also the theoretical work on international migration is useful for this analysis. Certain conceptualisations are more central than others. It seems that Piore's work on the labour-market hierarchies is particularly relevant. Moreover, relative deprivation and capitalist penetration of peripheral economies by the core economies seems to be highly applicable.

Furthermore, the theory of cumulative causation must also be said to have a role in explaining the development of cultures of migration, particularly in the case of the Nigerian trafficking flows.

Stavanger has become one of many small "hubs" that form a world system of migration for prostitution. Theories on international migration may go a long way in explaining why it is so, yet the same theories do not at all describe what to do about it.

The ancient strategy

Prostitution and migration is closely intertwined in the case of Stavanger. In fact prostitution in Stavanger actually depends to a large extent on international migration.

Prostitution as a survival strategy for migrants seems as important today as it ever has been.

Prostitution is often claimed to be the worlds oldest profession, but perhaps it may be better to describe it as one of the worlds oldest survival strategies. In the case of prostitution in Stavanger it still is a crucial strategy for many migrants.

The networks that operate in Stavanger appear to be risk-assessing, meaning that changes in legislation or local events may lead to changes in end destination. Any attempt at changing legislation to fight trafficking would require similar legislation throughout Europe in order to have any significant effect on stemming the flows from Nigeria.

The Social Problem

It must be underlined that the author of this thesis does not see prostitution in Stavanger per se as problematic. The reasons for this have been laid out in chapter 4, but result from a refusal to accept that the state can claim authority over the body of the individual.

Yet, at the same time the author of this thesis does consider the prevalence of Nigerians involved in prostitution in Stavanger to be a serious problem. But it is not simply because Nigerian women are involved in prostitution, it is because it seems likely that the majority of the women involved either currently are or have previously been locked in debt-bondage and are exploited at great lengths by criminal networks. This is a pan-European problem, and requires a pan-European solution.

I will finish this thesis with an encouragement of all European states to prioritise this issue within law enforcement. This is an international issue, and requires the responsibility of the international

community.

The local implications of a globalised prostitution market are many and ambiguous. More than any other one factor, the significance is that the problems of the developing world become visibly acute in one of the richest cities on the planet. The paradox is that it is not recognized in this manner by the local population. Sentiments ranging from conservative morality to aesthetic security have arisen in the debate over the topic. At present it is hard to see how or even if the situation should change in any significant way in the future.

Bibliography

- Achebe, Nwando. "The Road to Italy: Nigerian Sex Workers at Home and Abroad." *Journal of Women's History* 15, no. 4 (2004): 178–185.
- Agbiboa, D. E. "Between Corruption and Development: The Political Economy of State Robbery in Nigeria." *Journal of Business Ethics* (2009): 1–21.
- Agbu, O. "Corruption and Human Trafficking: The Nigerian Case." *West Africa Review* 4, no. 1 (2003): 1–13.
- Agustín, Laura María. *Sex at the Margins: Migration, Labour Markets and the Rescue Industry*. London: Zed Books, 2007.
- Albertine Prosjektet. *Annual Report 2010 (orig. Årsrapport 2010)*. Stavanger, 2011.
- Arango, Joaquin. "Global Trends and Issues - Explaining Migration: A Critical View." *International Social Science Journal* 52.3 (2000): 283–296.
- Arango, Joaquin, Graeme Hugo, Ali Kouaouci, Douglas S. Massey, Adela Pellegrino, and J. Edward Taylor. *Worlds in Motion: Understanding International Migration at the End of the Millennium*. Oxford; New York: Oxford University Press, 2008.
- Bauman, Zygmunt. *Globalization : the Human Consequences*. Cambridge UK: Polity Press, 1998.
- Brunovskis, Annette, and Guri Tyldum. *Crossing Borders: An Empirical Study of Transnational Prostitution and Trafficking in Human Beings*. Interface Media Norway: Fafo, 2004.
- Cameron, Sally, and Edward Newman. *Trafficking in Humans : Social, Cultural and Political Dimensions*. Tokyo; New York: United Nations University Press, 2008.
- Carling, Jørgen. *Migration, Human Smuggling and Trafficking from Nigeria to Europe*. Geneva: IOM, 2006.
- Carling, Jørgen., and International Organization for Migration. *Migration, Human Smuggling, and Trafficking from Nigeria to Europe*. Geneva: International Organization for Migration, 2006.
- Castells, Manuel. *The Informational City: Information Technology, Economic Restructuring, and the Urban-regional Process*. Wiley-Blackwell, 1991.
- Castles, Stephen. "The Factors That Make and Unmake Migration Policies." *International Migration Review* 38, no. 3 (Fall 2004): 852–884.
- Van Dijk, Rijk. "'Voodoo' on the Doorstep: Young Nigerian Prostitutes and Magic Policing in the Netherlands." *Africa* 71, no. 4 (2001): 558–586.
- Doezema, Jo. *Sex Slaves and Discourse Masters : the Construction of Trafficking*. London; New

York; New York: Zed Books ; Distributed in the USA exclusively by Palgrave Macmillan, 2010.

Douglas, Mary. *Purity and Danger: An Analysis of the Concepts of Pollution and Taboo*. London: Routledge, 2001.

Eriksen, Thomas Hylland. *Globalization: The Key Concepts*. Oxford: Berg Publishers, 2007.

Fadnes, Jon Kristian. "Horekrangel På Strandkaaien." *Rogalandsavis*. Stavanger, January 31, 2011.

Fekete, Liz. *A Suitable Enemy: Racism, Migration and Islamophobia in Europe*. London: Pluto Press, 2009.

Gibney, Matthew J. *The Ethics and Politics of Asylum: Liberal Democracy and the Response to Refugees*. Cambridge Univ. Press, 2004.

Frode M. Gjerald, "Lei Av Horestempel," *Rogalandsavis* (Stavanger, 20.10.2006).

Goldblatt, David., David. Held, Anthony. McGrew, and Jonathan. Perraton. *Global Transformations : Politics, Economics and Culture*. Cambridge: Polity Press, 1999.

Harvey, David. *Spaces of Hope*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2000.

Hegna, K., and W. Pedersen. "Sex for Overlevelse Eller Skyggebilder Av Kjaerlighet." *NOVA Rapport 5* (2002).

Hobsbawm, Eric. *Globalisation, Democracy and Terrorism*. London: Abacus, 2007.

Huysmans, Jeff. *The Politics of Insecurity: Fear, Migration and Asylum in the EU*. London, New York: Routledge, 2006.

International Labour Office - Special Action Programme to Combat Forced Labour (SAP-FL), *ILO Global Estimate of Forced Labour - Results and Methodology* (Geneva: ILO, 2012).

Jahnsen, Synnøve Økland. "Women Who Cross Borders—black Magic? A Critical Discourse Analysis of the Norwegian Newspaper Coverage." Bergen (UIB), 2007.

Jones, James. "Nigeria: Sex, Lies and Black Magic." *Unreported World*. UK: Channel 4, April 5, 2011.

Kaya, Ayhan. *Islam, Migration and Integration: The Age of Securitization*. New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009.

Knutsen, Kjell Arne. "Dømt for Menneskehandel Og Hallikvirksomhet." *Stavanger Aftenblad*. Stavanger, July 5, 2010, Nettavis edition.

Kuo, Lenore. *Prostitution Policy: Revolutionizing Practice Through a Gendered Perspective*. New York: New York University Press, 2005.

- Lee, Maggy. *Human Trafficking*. Cullompton, Devon, U.K.: Willan, 2007.
- Lee, Maggy. *Trafficking and Global Crime Control*. London; Thousand Oaks, Calif.: SAGE, 2011.
- MacKinnon, Catherine A. "Feminism, Marxism, Method, and the State: An Agenda for Theory." *Signs* 7, no. 3 (1982): 515–544.
- Massey, D. S, J. Arango, G. Hugo, A. Kouaouci, A. Pellegrino, and J. E Taylor. "Theories of International Migration: a Review and Appraisal." *Population and Development Review* no. 19.3 (1993): 431–466.
- O’neill, Maggie. *Prostitution and Feminism: Towards a Politics of Feeling*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers Ltd, 2001.
- Obadare, Ebenezer., and Wale. Adebani. *Encountering the Nigerian State*. New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010.
- Ocholor, C. L, C. Metuonu Iheanacho, and O. O Asuo. "Corruption in Contemporary Nigeria: The Way Out." *Am. J. Soc. Mgmt. Sci* 2, no. 1 (2011): 91–99.
- Okojie, Christina E.E. "International Trafficking of Women for The Purpose of Sexual Exploitation and Prostitution. The Nigerian Case." *Pakistan Journal of Women’s Studies: Alam-e-Niswan* 16, no. 1&2 (2009): 147–178.
- Pedersen, W., and K. Hegna. "Children and Adolescents Who Sell Sex: a Community Study* 1." *Social Science & Medicine* 56, no. 1 (2003): 135–147.
- Prosjenteret Oslo Kommune. "Prosjenteret Årsrapport 2011," 2012. http://prosjentret.no/?wpfb_dl=559.
- Ribadu, Nuhu. "Capital Loss and Corruption: The Example of Nigeria; Testimony Before the House Financial Services Committee." *US House Committee on Financial Services* (May 19, 2009).
- Richmond, Anthony H. "Globalization: Implications for Immigrants and Refugees." *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 25, no. 5 (September 2002): 707–727.
- Sassen, Saskia. *Globalization and Its Discontents: Essays on the New Mobility of People and Money*. New York: New Press, 1998.
- Saskia, Sassen. "Women’s Burden: Counter-Geographies of Globalization and the Feminization of Survival." *Nordic Journal of International Law* 71, no. 2 (May 2002): 255–274.
- Saskia, Sassen. "Strategic Instantiations of Gendering in the Global Economy." In *Gender and US Immigration: Contemporary Trends*, edited by Pierrette Hondagneu-Sotelo, 43–60. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 2003.
- Schiller, Nina Glick, Linda Basch, and Christina Szanton Blanc. "From Immigrant to Transmigrant: Theorizing Transnational Migration." *Anthropological Quarterly* (1995): 48–63.

- Scholte, Jan Aart. *Globalization: A Critical Introduction*. Palgrave Macmillan, 2000.
- Sexton, Catey. "Looking for Love." *Louis Theroux's Weird Weekends*. BBC, October 23, 2000.
- Shaw, Martin. "Globality and Historical Sociology." In *Historical Sociology of International Relations*, edited by Stephen Hobden and John M. Hobson. Cambridge, UK; New York: Cambridge University Press, 2002.
- Skilbrei, May-Len. "Nigeriansk Prostitusjon På Norsk: Feil Kvinner På Feil Sted." In *Norske Seksualiteter*, edited by Åse Røthing and Wencke Mühleisen, 165–184. Oslo: Cappelen akademisk forlag, 2009.
- Skogseth, Geir. *Trafficking in Women—Fact-finding Trip to Nigeria (Abuja, Lagos and Benin City) 12-26 March 2006*. Oslo: Landinfo - The country of Origin Information Center, 2006.
- Tor-Erling Thømt Ruud, and Rolf J. Widerøe. "Sexkjøpannonser Er Ikke Ulovlig." *VG*, October 28, 2011. <http://www.vg.no/nyheter/innenriks/artikkel.php?artid=10015470>.
- United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime. "United Nations Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime and the Protocols Thereto." UN, New York 2004.
- Vertovec, Steven. *Transnationalism*. London and New York: Routledge, Taylor & Francis Group, 2009.
- Wallerstein, Immanuel. *The Modern World-system. 1 : Capitalist Agriculture and the Origins of the European World-economy in the Sixteenth Century*. New York: Academic Press, 1974.
- Wimmer, Andreas, and Nina Glick Schiller. "Methodological Nationalism, the Social Sciences, and the Study of Migrations." *International Migration Review* 37, no. 3 (Fall 2003): 576–610.
- "Sex Workers in Europe Manifesto." Brussels, Belgium, 2005.
<http://www.sexworkeurope.org/en/resources-mainmenu-189/manifesto>.