

HANSEN, MATHIAS DUVHOLT
SUPERVISOR: GRAESSE, MALIN KRISTINE

A Century of Love and Strugg Gay Men's Lives Through the Camera's Eye, 1850-1950

Bachelor thesis, 2024

LHIS290 1 Bacheloroppgave i historie

Lektor Degree in Education for Grades 8-13

Department of Cultural and Linguistic Studies

Faculty of Education and Humanities

Word Count: 7598



(Photograph III)

Table of Contents

| | |
|--|----|
| 1 Introduction..... | 1 |
| 1.1 Problem Statement and Purpose | 1 |
| 1.2 Delimitations of the thesis..... | 2 |
| 1.3 Theoretical framework..... | 3 |
| 1.3.1 The role of photography as a cultural expression | 3 |
| 1.3.2 Reacher status | 4 |
| 1.4 Method of research | 5 |
| 1.4.1 Contextualizing Photographic Representations | 6 |
| 2 Historical Perspectives on Homosexuality..... | 8 |
| 3 Analyses..... | 10 |
| 3.1 Marriage | 10 |
| 3.2 Love at the price of loneliness..... | 12 |
| 3.3 Homosexual men facing discriminatory laws head on..... | 14 |
| 3.4 Masculinity and the double life | 15 |
| 3.5 Telling those who know - the hidden language among men | 18 |
| 4 Conclusion | 21 |
| 5 Photographs and illustrations | 23 |
| 6 Literature | 29 |

1 Introduction

At the turn of the 21 century, a simple yet profound action set in motion an extraordinary journey that ended with the creation of *Loving: A Photographic History of Men in Love 1850s-1950s Nini-Treadwell Collection*. While browsing an antique shop, Hugh Nini and Neal Treadwell stumbled upon a photograph that stood out amidst the cluttered shelves. This was no ordinary photo. It showed two men gazing into each other's eyes, unmistakably in love. This unexpected discovery marked the beginning of a passionate quest. Intrigued and moved by the powerful emotion captured in that single frame, Nini and Treadwell embarked on a mission to find and collect similar images, eventually amassing a collection of over 2,800 photographs.¹

Each photograph in this remarkable collection serves as a newly opened window into the past, revealing the hidden histories of men who dared to define societal norms to express their love. These images, often kept secret for decades, offer a rare glimpse into the intimate lives of individuals who lived during a time when same-sex relationships were largely condemned or ignored. The collection not only preserves these moments of affection but also challenges viewers to reconsider and appreciate the resilience and courage of those who navigated the treacherous waters of societal expectations. As we delve into these photographs, we uncover stories of love, defiance, and the enduring human spirit, shedding light on a chapter of history that has long been shrouded in darkness.

1.1 Problem Statement and Purpose

This thesis examines the representation of homosexual relationships in the photographic collection *Loving: A Photographic History of Men in Love 1850s-1950s*² and how these representations reflect the legal and societal narratives about homosexuality in the United States from 1850 to 1950. This research is significant because it provides insights into how homosexuality was perceived and treated during a time marked by both overt and covert societal norms. By analyzing these photographs, we can uncover the contrasts between public

¹ Dee Swann, Hugh Nini, and Neal Treadwell, "Perspective | Never before Published Images of Men in Love between 1850 and 1950," *Washington Post*, September 28, 2020, <https://www.washingtonpost.com/photography/2020/09/28/loving-a-photographic-history-of-men-in-love/>.

² Elena Carotti, *Loving: A Photographic History of Men in Love 1850s-1950s Nini-Treadwell Collection* (Milan: 5 continents, 2020).

representation and what was kept hidden, thereby gaining a deeper understanding of LGBTQ+ history.

The research question this bachelor thesis is going to be looking at is: How does the representation of homosexual relationships in the photographic collection *Loving: A Photographic History of Men in Love 1850s-1950s* reflect the legal and societal narratives about homosexuality from 1850 to 1950 in the United States?

The purpose of this thesis is to analyze the photographic representations of homosexual men from 1850 to 1950, as presented in *Loving*. Through this analysis, I aim to illuminate how these images both challenge and reflect prevailing legal and social norms regarding homosexuality. By examining what was presented to the public versus what was deliberately concealed, we can understand how these images function as historical artifacts that provide valuable insights into societal attitudes towards homosexuality during this period. The publication of these photographs allows for a deeper examination of societal norms and values regarding same-sex relationships, offering valuable insights into the historical context of LGBTQ+ experiences. When looking at norms and values within photography, it is essential to consider not only what is presented to the public but also what is deliberately concealed. The photographs in this book, once hidden from public view, now serve as invaluable historical artifacts, enabling scholars to explore and understand societal attitudes towards homosexuality during the period under study. Through this thesis, I hope to achieve a deeper understanding of how visual representations in photography can mirror and challenge societal and legal frameworks, and to contribute to a broader understanding of LGBTQ+ history in the United States from the mid-19th to the mid-20th century. This analysis sheds light on the multifaceted nature of visual representations of love and intimacy within historical contexts.

1.2 Delimitations of the thesis

The scope of this thesis is specifically confined to analyzing photographic representations of homosexual relationships as presented in *Loving: A Photographic History of Men in Love 1850s-1950s*. This collection of photographs provides a unique lens through which to look at the visual documentation of same-sex male intimacy and affection over a century in the United States. The selected timeframe, from the 1850s to the 1950s, encompasses significant shifts in societal and legal attitudes toward homosexuality, offering a rich historical context. The focus of this study will be on photographs that were originally private or unpublished during their time, only surfacing in the public domain much later. This aspect of the study is important to

take into account as it allows for an exploration of not only the visual content of these photographs but also the historical circumstances under which they were created and kept hidden. By analyzing these images, the study aims to uncover the implicit and explicit societal norms regarding homosexuality that influenced their creation and concealment. Key aspects of societal attitudes to be examined include legal restrictions, such as sodomy laws and their enforcement, the use of hidden signs and communication, and public opinion shaped by cultural narratives. The thesis will also delve into how these attitudes were both reflected in and challenged by the visual culture of the time. For instance, how did these photographs serve as acts of resistance against prevailing norms? How did they provide a space for expressing affection and identity in a society that largely condemned such expressions? By concentrating on these specific aspects, the thesis aims to contribute to a deeper understanding of the historical context of LGBTQ+ experiences. It will highlight how visual representations can both mirror and contest societal values, providing insights into the lived realities of homosexual individuals during a time of significant legal and social constraints. Through this analysis, the thesis seeks to illuminate the complex relation between private lives and public attitudes, revealing how photographic documentation can serve as a powerful tool for historians when looking at social changes.

1.3 Theoretical framework

1.3.1 The role of photography as a cultural expression

It is crucial to acknowledge the transformative power of this emerging new technology during the period. Notably, the medium had the potential to influence legislative decisions profoundly, as seen in the instance where Carleton E. Watkins' photograph of Yosemite Valley (see photo I) influenced Congress to legislate its protection in 1864.³ This example underlines the unintended impact photography can have beyond its role in documenting moments. It could encapsulate narratives, evoke emotions, and shift cultural and political landscapes. The photographs featured in *Loving* reveal images once hidden from public view by societal norms and legal frameworks that criminalized homosexuality, highlighting the historic sodomy laws in Virginia as testament.⁴ These photographs narrate the stories of homosexual men in a time

³ "The Nineteenth Century: The Invention of Photography," Gallery, National Gallery of Art, accessed May 1, 2024, <https://www.nga.gov/features/in-light-of-the-past/the-19th-century-the-invention-of-photography.html>.

⁴ The Virginia Department of Historic Resources, "Timeline of LGBT History in Virginia and the United States" (The Virginia Department of Historic Resources, July 2021), https://www.dhr.virginia.gov/wp-content/uploads/2021/07/LGBTQ_Timeline-Virginia-and-US.pdf.

where showcasing expressions of love found little acceptance in mainstream society. As such, these images serve not only as artistic expressions but also as important historical documents that offer insight into the lives and challenges faced by the LGBTQ+ community during that time. The significance of photography as a cultural phenomenon is further exemplified through the works of Mathew Brady, whose Civil War era photographs offer a visceral glimpse into wartime realities behind the scene of the battle.⁵ Similarly, the images within *Loving* make clear the concealed expressions of male love, contributing to our understanding of a rarely acknowledged aspect of the time under study. By analyzing the portrayal of homosexual men in these photographs, one can illuminate the role of visual culture in shaping and challenging contemporary notions of identity, gender, and sexuality. Through these visual narratives, photography emerges as a pivotal force in cultural expression, molding societal perceptions and contributing to the broader discourse on LGBTQ+ representation and rights.⁶

1.3.2 Reacher status

In exploring the representation of homosexual relationships through the photographic collection *Loving*, this thesis investigation situates itself at the crossroad of legal, societal, visual and cultural narratives that frame the lived experiences of homosexual individuals from 1850 to 1950 in the United States. It is crucial to keep in mind the scholarly background on the topic, epitomized by an extensive body of literature on LGBTQ+ history, the historical construction of sexual identities, and the pivotal role of visual media in the societal perception and representation of queer identities. Central to the foundation of this research is the work of historians like George Chauncey, whose seminal work *Gay New York*⁷ discusses the complex social worlds and public cultures that gay men navigated in early 20th-century New York, offering insight into how homosexual relationships were both hidden and visible within certain urban settings. Similarly, Estelle B. Freedman's *Intimate Matters: A History of Sexuality in America*⁸ provides a broader historical account of evolving sexual norms, including the legal and societal means employed to regulate homosexuality.

⁵ Douglas Perry, "The Civil War as Photographed by Mathew Brady," Archive, National Archives, August 15, 2016, <https://www.archives.gov/education/lessons/brady-photos>.

⁶ Michael Gardiner, Gunalan Nadarajan, and Catherine Soussloff, *The Handbook of Visual Culture*, ed. Ian Heywood and Barry Sandywell, 1st ed. (Bloomsbury Publishing Plc, 2012), 446, <https://doi.org/10.5040/9781474294140>.

⁷ George Chauncey, 5. *Gay New York: Gender, Urban Culture, and the Making of the Gay Male World, 1890-1940*, Reprint edition (New York: Basic Books, 1995), <https://catalog.princeton.edu/catalog/SCSB-3142342>.

⁸ John D'Emilio and Estelle B. Freedman, *Intimate Matters: A History of Sexuality in America*, Third edition (Chicago London: The University of Chicago Press, 2012).

The collection *Loving*, functioning as a significant research artifact, offers rich visual and personal narrative that contrasts sharply with the representations found in legal landscape of the period. The photographs within *Loving* are not just pictures; they are testimonials to resilient relationships and love stories that persisted despite societal condemnation and legal prosecution. In this regard, the work of art historians such as James Smalls, particularly in *Homosexuality in Art*⁹, becomes relevant, as it examines how visual representations have historically contributed to the negotiation and understanding of queer identities. Incorporation of queer history is essential to comprehend how the representation of homosexual relationships in *Loving* reflects broader societal narratives. The field of queer history has significantly evolved, with scholars like Jonathan Ned Katz and his work *Gay American History*¹⁰ pioneering the tracing of homosexual histories in the United States. Recent scholarship, for instance, *Queer Images: A History of Gay and Lesbian Film in America*¹¹ by Harry M. Benshoff and Sean Griffin, continues to explore the intersections of queerness and visual culture, emphasizing the powerful role of imagery in shaping and challenging societal norms regarding sexuality. However, despite the rich tapestry of scholarship in LGBTQ+ studies and visual culture, there remains a paucity of focused academic inquiries into photographic depictions of homosexual relationships across the nineteenth and twentieth centuries within a consolidated American context. In gathering these theoretical perspectives, this research critically examines how *Loving* serves not just as an archive of homosexual affection but as a lens through which the relation between visual representation, legal regulation, and societal norms can be looked at. Through meticulously analyzing the photographs within *Loving*, this thesis aims to illuminate how these personal moments of affection and partnership both reflect and challenge contemporary narratives about homosexuality, thus contributing to broader discussions within the fields of LGBTQ+ history, visual culture, and the social construction of sexuality.

1.4 Method of research

The research methodology for this thesis is rooted in a detailed examination of both individual and collective photographs within the book *Loving*. This approach facilitates a deep dive into the complexities of each image and the volume as a whole, enabling an exploration that goes

⁹ James Smalls, *Homosexuality in Art*, Temporis Collection (New York: Parkstone, 2003),

<http://www.parkstone-international.com/detail/9/homosexuality-in-art/2#sthash.FVAmvrLw.dpbs>.

¹⁰ Jonathan Katz, *Gay American History: Lesbians and Gay Men in the U.S.A. : A Documentary History* (Avon Books, 1976), <https://archive.org/details/gayamericanhisto00katz/page/n5/mode/1up>.

¹¹ Harry M. Benshoff and Sean Griffin, *Queer Images: A History of Gay and Lesbian Film in America, Genre and Beyond* (Lanham, Md: Rowman & Littlefield Pub, 2006).

beyond superficial appraisal to uncover the intricate manifestations and meanings embedded in these photographs. Reflecting on Hans Belting's insight, "Photography reproduces the gaze that we cast upon the world,"¹² it becomes apparent that these images are invaluable in decoding historical attitudes towards male love and affection, providing a unique lens through which to analyze societal perceptions of homosexuality. To interpret these images, it is crucial to possess a nuanced understanding of the historical context that influenced and shaped societal attitudes during the specified period.¹³ This necessitates an examination that extends past a mere glance, requiring a thorough analysis of visual cues and contextual nuances. Key to this analytical process is the observation and scrutiny of each photograph, employing observation and analysis as primary tools for this exploration. In this context, analyzing images of homosexual men through the lens of visual culture allows us to perceive these photographs not just as visual documents but as mechanisms of classification and representation. By dissecting the poses, settings, and contexts within these images, it becomes possible to unearth the prevalent societal attitudes and stereotypes, illuminating the visual construction and societal perception of homosexuality.¹⁴ Given the potential repercussions of possessing such images during the era under study, these photographs are posited to align with Roland Barthes concept of the "Winter Garden" photograph, signifying deeply personal photographs loaded with emotional significance.¹⁵ This methodology, enriched by references to the critical perspectives of Belting and Barthes, offers a multifaceted understanding of the visual representation of male love from 1850 to 1950, highlighting the societal, emotional, and visual complexities inherent in these images.

1.4.1 Contextualizing Photographic Representations

In analyzing the historical significance of photographs depicting men in love from 1850 to 1950, it is essential to consider the context surrounding their creation. This investigation delves into how these photographs served not just as depictions of private moments but also as crucial elements in the construction of identity during a time when such relationships were legally and socially condemned.¹⁶ The collection of images within *Loving* evokes the feeling of browsing a family album, revealing snapshots of intimacy and affection that were compelled to exist in

¹² Hans Belting, Thomas Dunlap, and Hans Belting, *An Anthropology of Images: Picture, Medium, Body* (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 2011), 154.

¹³ Gardiner, Nadarajan, and Soussloff, *The Handbook of Visual Culture*, 95.

¹⁴ Gardiner, Nadarajan, and Soussloff, 448.

¹⁵ Roland Barthes and Roland Barthes, *Camera Lucida: Reflections on Photography*, 2. impr, Flamingo Edition (London: Fontana Paperbacks, 1988), 67.

¹⁶ Gardiner, Nadarajan, and Soussloff, *The Handbook of Visual Culture*, chap. 18.

the shadows. These clandestine images, often found hidden in personal belongings or family heirlooms, reveal the intense need of individuals to capture and preserve the essence of their relationships. Despite the prevailing societal norms that forced their love underground, the existence of these photographs is a powerful testament to their courage and resilience. They encapsulate moments of joy, intimacy, and defiance against oppressive regulations, serving as invaluable artifacts that memorialize their love.¹⁷ The act of photographing these intimate moments was not merely an artistic endeavor but a bold statement of existence and resistance.¹⁸ These images, beyond their immediate emotional significance, also played roles in classifying and representing aspects of identity, desire, and community.¹⁹ They are poignant reminders of the challenges faced in documenting such moments amidst technical and logistical constraints of the time. Photographing required significant effort, reflecting the dedication of those who sought to preserve these intimate moments of affection. Thus, the collection of photographs analyzed provides not only a window into the private lives of gay men in this historical period but also highlights the broader narrative of love's enduring capacity to resist, endure, and be commemorated despite adversity.

¹⁷ Gardiner, Nadarajan, and Soussoff, 454.

¹⁸ Gardiner, Nadarajan, and Soussoff, 454.

¹⁹ Gardiner, Nadarajan, and Soussoff, chap. 18.

2 Historical Perspectives on Homosexuality

Throughout various periods, society's understanding and acceptance of homosexuality have witnessed considerable evolution, deeply intertwined with broader sociocultural transformations. The delineation of "homosexuality" as a distinct concept was only formalized in the late 19th century by psychologist Karoly Maria Benkert, introducing a new perspective in the discourse on human sexuality that diverged from theological interpretations to a framework grounded in medical and psychological analysis.²⁰ This pivotal moment signified a gradual shift towards considering homosexual tendencies as involuntary rather than a matter of moral choice, aligning with the progressive advancements in medical science of the time.²¹ Despite these advancements, stringent legal frameworks, notably Sodomy Laws, remained in place, aiming to safeguard public morality by criminalizing not only homosexual acts but also extending to other sexual practices deemed deviant, including oral sex and cross-dressing.²² These laws underlined the societal aversion to non-heteronormative expressions of love and identity, systematically marginalizing and persecuting homosexual individuals, particularly men, by stigmatizing their sexual identity as deviant and unnatural.²³ The relentless application of these laws inflicted significant hardship on the gay community, compelling individuals to navigate their identities within a context of surveillance and social ostracism. Photographic evidence from the period, as displayed in collections such as *Loving*, subtly reveals the constrained existence of gay men who were often depicted in studio settings to mask their identity and avoid public and legal reprobation. The historical trajectory of homosexuality from the 18th to the 19th century presents a tapestry of changing attitudes encompassing theological

²⁰ Brent Pickett, "Homosexuality," in *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, ed. Edward N. Zalta, Spring 2021 (Metaphysics Research Lab, Stanford University, 2021),

<https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/spr2021/entries/homosexuality/>.

²¹ Pickett.

²² Lewis R. Parker, ed., "The Penal Code of the State of New York, Being Chapter 676 of the Laws of 1881, as Amended by the Laws of 1882-1900" (The Banks Law Publishing Company, January 2, 1912), <https://hdl.handle.net/2027/hvd.hl46ui?urlappend=%3Bseq=7>.

These laws lasted for more than 100 years in the US, and other countries still have laws against homosexuality. Richard Weinmeyer, "The Decriminalization of Sodomy in the United States," *AMA Journal of Ethics* 16, no. 11 (November 1, 2014): 916–22, <https://doi.org/10.1001/virtualmentor.2014.16.11.hlaw1-1411.>)

Saudi Arabia is such a country where a man was sentenced to 500 lashes and 5 years of imprisonment for homosexuality among other criminal offences. Amnesty International, "URGENT ACTION MAN SENTENCED FOR HOMOSEXUALITY" (Amnesty International, November 12, 2010), <https://www.amnesty.org/fr/wp-content/uploads/2021/07/mde230132010en.pdf>.

²³ William N. ESKRIDGE and William N. Eskridge, *Gaylaw: Challenging the Apartheid of the Closet* (Harvard University Press, 2009), <https://www.jstor.org/stable/j.ctvjz82vn>.

condemnation, medical pathologization, and legal criminalization.²⁴ These shifting perspectives have profoundly influenced the contemporary struggle for LGBTQ+ rights and the ongoing efforts to dismantle ingrained societal prejudices towards diverse sexual orientations.

A critical examination of historical perspectives on homosexuality necessitates an appreciation for the dynamic processes through which identities are constructed and contested within specific historical and cultural contexts.²⁵ Such an analysis permits a more intricate understanding of the representations of homosexuality across time. The discourse presented in *Evidence of Experience* by Scott, referencing Samuel R. Delany's experience at the St. Marks bathhouse challenged prevailing representations of homosexuals as “isolated perverts.”²⁶ This exemplifies the potential of personal experiences to challenge and transcend prevailing stereotypes of homosexual individuals as marginalized figures. In scrutinizing photographic depictions of gay men during the 19th and early 20th centuries, one can explore the intricate relation between individual narratives and broader societal forces. Through these visual documents, it becomes possible to unearth the nuanced expressions of gay identity, which were often obscured by prevailing stereotypes and derogatory portrayals. This historical inquiry reveals the complex layers of homosexual identity, shaped by a multitude of factors including legal constraints, societal expectations, and the internal struggle for acceptance and recognition.

²⁴ Kelly Kraus, “Queer Theology: Reclaiming Christianity for the LGBT Community,” *E-Research: A Journal of Undergraduate Work* 2, no. 3 (2014): 7, <https://digitalcommons.chapman.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1055&context=e-Research>.

²⁵ Joan W Scott, “The Evidence of Experience,” 2024, 792.

²⁶ Joan W Scott, “The Evidence of Experience,” 2024, 774

3 Analyses

The book *Loving* presents a comprehensive collection of over 2700 photographs that document the experiences of love shared amongst men from 1850 to 1950. For the purposes of this academic endeavor, this thesis will dive deeper into a select portfolio of images, meticulously vetted to shed light on the evolving themes of homosexuality through different historical lenses. This scrutiny extends beyond assessing these images as mere visual records, treating them instead as integral pieces of a larger tapestry that narrates the intricate history of male same-sex relations in America. Employing a comparative methodology, this study seeks to unearth and analyze recurring motifs and thematic elements across the period, with particular attention to the depiction of intimacy, expressions of masculinity, symbolic undertones, and the overarching social environment of the time. Given the secretive and often strongly disliked landscape that gay men navigated during these years, it is worth noting that the majority of these images remain unnamed or lack direct attribution, stripped of identifying markers likely due to the risk of exposure and persecution. To circumvent this obstacle and ensure clarity when analyzing these images, arbitrary names have been assigned to facilitate a structured and coherent analysis. By dissecting these selected visual narratives, this thesis endeavors to decipher the latent significances and sociocultural implications these historical images harbor. Through a meticulous examination, the aim is to enrich our understanding of the historical and cultural frameworks that influenced both the portrayal and perception of male same-sex relations, unearthing the multifaceted dimensions of identity, affection, and societal norms that these photographs encapsulate.

3.1 Marriage

Within the book *Loving*, an intricate exploration into the nuanced possibility of gay marriage or its vivid depictions of gay men from the period of 1850 to 1950 is unveiled. Revealing a profound understanding of the socio-cultural contexts of these relationships conveyed through photography. Among the extensive catalog of 2,700 photographs, a distinct twenty-one standout for capturing moments where one or both men wear artifacts resembling wedding bands.²⁷ This aspect alone signals the intricate layers of relationship dynamics and societal acceptance depicted within the collection. Moreover, an additional three photographs subtly allude to matrimonial ceremonies in a less direct yet equally poignant manner, expanding the narrative surrounding the representation of gay relationships during this time period. A

²⁷ Carotti, *Loving*.

photograph *Two Men Getting Married* (see photo II) becomes a focal point for this exploration, symbolizing an overt matrimonial act as one individual is captured in the act of placing what appears to be a wedding ring onto his partner's finger. This scene is further played out with the presence of a third individual, mirroring the role of an officiant, his hand raised as if officiating a wedding. The use of an umbrella as a prop under which the two men stand is no mere coincidence; it bears significant cultural symbolism. The authors write in an article that “Our collection tells us that beginning sometime in the mid-1800s, and continuing into the 1920s, two men posing under an umbrella together was an outward declaration of love between the two men.”²⁸ Arguing that as early as the mid-19th century and extending into the roaring twenties, the imagery of two men positioned under a single umbrella was a symbolic gesture, signaling a public declaration of love between the men. This was a form of marriage not tolerated or recognized legally, yet it bore profound personal significance for those depicted.

Furthermore, the photograph named *Not Married but Willing to Be* (see photo III) presents two men, standing in close proximity, their hands clasping a sign that boldly expresses their desire and willingness to enter into a marriage with each other. This visualization thrusts the viewer into a contemplation of the concealed layers of affection these individuals felt compelled to mask from the public eye, challenging societal norms and provoking a reconsideration of what goes into a marriage as understood in their time. The image itself harbors what could be perceived as a 'punctum' to the observant eye, a subtle tear mid-sign that metaphorically could represent the societal tear these individuals sought to achieve against the conventional norms of marriage.²⁹ An adjunct image to this narrative is found in the preceding page, where the picture *Under the umbrella* (see photo IV) features the same two men gazing into each other's eyes, an umbrella held between them, further cementing their silent declaration of a desire to exist freely and openly as a committed pair. Transitioning from this bold declaration, the narrative then shifts focus to a photograph named *Honeymooncart in Reno* (see photo V), where two men are seen on a cart with a sign reading “Honeymoon Special Reno 1st stop”. Unlike the direct approach of the previous images, this photograph suggests a more subdued and covert display of affection. The men stand without any clear romantic indications, save for a discreet but telling gesture; their hands slightly entwined, revealing a clandestine expression of love that opposes the more overt declarations previously observed. One of the men is seen with a

²⁸ Swann, Nini, and Treadwell, “Perspective | Never before Published Images of Men in Love between 1850 and 1950.”

²⁹ Barthes and Barthes, *Camera Lucida*, 25.

wedding ring, suggesting he is married, potentially indicative of a Lavender Marriage—a union of convenience designed to quell suspicions regarding an individual's sexual orientation.³⁰ These marriages, especially prevalent with the rise of Hollywood's golden era in the 1920s, underline the pressures on gay men to conform to heteronormative standards to succeed in the public sphere and to be hired by the big studios, often at the expense of their true identities.³¹ This phenomenon paints a poignant picture of the lengths to which individuals went to navigate societal boundaries, as further illustrated by the photograph *Two Men and Two Women Looking at Photographs* (see photo VI). Here, subtleties within the image, such as a man seated on another's lap while placing a comforting hand on one of the women's back, hints at the intricate web of relationships formed to shield true desires behind the curtain of societal acceptance. Highlighting the sacrifices made in pursuit of personal happiness within the constraints of the period. Marriage, traditionally viewed as a declaration of love sealed under Gods witness, carries with it not only a personal but a legal recognition that bestows upon the union certain rights and privileges, such as property inheritance, tax benefits, and legal status.³² For gay men of this era, the inaccessibility of marriage denied them these rights, illuminating the underlying motivations behind entering into Lavender Marriages. It was a survival strategy, a means to conform to societal expectations while seeking to preserve a semblance of their true selves.

3.2 Love at the price of loneliness

The exploration of loneliness among gay men through the lens of historical photographs offers a poignant narrative on the intrinsic human desire for connection, juxtaposed with the inherent isolation imposed by societal norms. The theme of loneliness, highly relevant in contemporary discussions about the gay community, finds a deep-rooted echo in history. Research indicates that over 60% of gay men today experience feelings of loneliness on a regular basis, casting a shadow on the strides made towards acceptance and understanding.³³ This stark reality frames the analysis of images in *Loving*, a collection that traverses the 1850-1950 period, unearthing the emotional landscapes of gay men's lives through visual documentation. A recurring motif in the collection is the absence of people other than the subjects themselves in the photographs,

³⁰ "Lavender Marriage," TheFreeDictionary, accessed May 7, 2024, <https://medical-dictionary.thefreedictionary.com/lavender+marriage>.

³¹ Morgan Thaddeus, "When Hollywood Studios Married Off Gay Stars to Keep Their Sexuality a Secret," *HISTORY*, July 26, 2023, <https://www.history.com/news/hollywood-lmarriages-gay-stars-lgbt>.

³² Lina Guillen, "Marriage Rights and Benefits," in *Nolo*, accessed May 7, 2024, <https://www.nolo.com/legal-encyclopedia/marriage-rights-benefits-30190.html>.

³³ Megan E. Marziali et al., "Loneliness and Self-Rated Physical Health Among Gay, Bisexual and Other Men Who Have Sex with Men in Vancouver, Canada," *Journal of Epidemiology and Community Health* 74, no. 7 (June 2020): 553–59, <https://doi.org/10.1136/jech-2019-213566>.

particularly evident in the older studio portraits. For instance, the photograph titled *Lovers in a Studio* (see photo VII), circa 1860, depicts two men embracing, encapsulated within the confines of a photo studio. Studio photography, primarily based in metropolitan areas such as New York where being gay was clandestine, offered a sanctuary of sorts.³⁴ Yet, this physical seclusion could not shield individuals from the pervading loneliness accentuated by societal rejection and the need to conceal one's identity. The existential solitude experienced by these men is clearly illustrated through personal accounts, such as that of Matthiessen, who, overwhelmed by loneliness, tragically ended his life.³⁵ His last words, documented in a letter, resonate with the profound isolation felt by many "I can no longer bear the loneliness with which I am faced."³⁶ This statement not only underlines the emotional toll of societal exclusion but also hints at the limitations of physical spaces, like studios, to offer solace from the intangible weights of rejection and solitude. Advancements in photography technology facilitated a migration from the studio's enclosing walls to the expansive embrace of nature. However, this transition did not necessarily equate to a mitigation of loneliness. Photographs of couples in secluded natural settings, devoid of any bystanders, subtly communicate the continued necessity to hide. The image *Two Men and a Car* (see photo VIII), set against a scenic coastal backdrop, epitomizes this narrative. The absence of others in these outdoor scenes accentuates the couple's isolation, reflecting a vivid reality of love lived in the shadows. The evolution of photographic contexts from closed studios to open natural environments mirrors a shift in how relationships were documented, moving from the safety of seclusion to a semblance of freedom tinged with vulnerability. *Edward and his chum* (see photo IX), placed against the backdrop of rolling hills, visually contrasting the natural world with the unnatural societal perception of two men showing intimacy.³⁷ This underline not only the couple's isolation but also highlights their resilience in seeking moments of connection amidst prevailing adversities. We are now navigating the intricate tapestry of love, intimacy, and exclusion, unearthing the silent narratives woven into the fabric of gay men's historical experiences. These pictures illustrate the stark realities of societal boundaries, the never-ending search for personal

³⁴ Ellen Tisdale et al., "In Focus: The Evolution of the Personal Camera" (Digital Public Library of America, July 2015), <https://dp.la/exhibitions/evolution-personal-camera/early-photography>.

³⁵ Steven L Lewis, "Gay Masquerade: Male Homosexuals in American Cities, 1910 to 1940" (Master Theses, Western Michigan University, 1988), https://scholarworks.wmich.edu/masters_theses/1139?utm_source=scholarworks.wmich.edu%2Fmasters_theses%2F1139&utm_medium=PDF&utm_campaign=PDFCoverPages.

³⁶ Lewis.

³⁷ Carol Armstrong, "Automatism and Agency Intertwined: A Spectrum of Photographic Intentionality," *Critical Inquiry* 38, no. 4 (June 2012): 706, <https://doi.org/10.1086/667421>.

happiness, and the loneliness that accompanies love in the face of adversity. The collection shows the enclosed safety of studios with the open yet discreet settings of nature, charts a progression from physical to emotional landscapes, reflecting a nuanced exploration of identity and relationships within the broader spectrum of societal norms and constraints.

3.3 Homosexual men facing discriminatory laws head on

Between 1850 and 1950, a critical period in American history, a series of laws and legislative measures specifically targeting homosexual behavior emerged, reflecting the societal stigmatization of sexuality that deviated from societal standards. This era was marked by an expanding legal framework that sought to regulate, and oftentimes punish, what was considered deviant sexual conduct. A detailed examination of New York City's legal landscape offers a unique lens through which to observe the evolution of societal attitudes towards homosexuality, and the consequent legislative responses. New York City, with its complex legal structures functioning at both state and federal levels, provides a poignant case study for examining the continuity and change in laws targeting homosexuals over time. By the late 19th century, post-Civil War societal shifts were beginning to influence legal definitions of crimes against individuals, as well as public decency and morality. This period saw the explicit integration of laws aimed at homosexuals within New York's penal code, most notably in the 1881 edition, which listed sodomy under *Bigamy, Incest, and Crimes against Nature*.³⁸ Paragraph 303, a statute addressing sodomy, outlined punishable actions in stark terms, equating homosexual acts with offenses like bigamy and incest, thereby reinforcing the societal perception of homosexuality as a moral and deviant transgression.³⁹ The classification of sodomy alongside acts such as necrophilia and bestiality not only stigmatized homosexual behavior but profoundly marginalized the gay community by association with universally condemned practices. The legislative discourse of this era often illogically linked homosexuality with predatory behavior, further demonizing gay men despite evidence to the contrary regarding the actual demographic of perpetrators.⁴⁰ The 1929 criminal case of *People v. Friede* marked a significant moment in New York City's legal attempts to suppress and regulate homosexuality.⁴¹ The case centered around the possession of *The Well of Loneliness*, a book the court condemned as obscene for

³⁸ Parker, "The Penal Code of the State of New York, Being Chapter 676 of the Laws of 1881, as Amended by the Laws of 1882-1900, Inclusive," 130.

³⁹ Parker, para. v paragraph 303 Sodomy.

⁴⁰ ESKRIDGE and Eskridge, *Gaylaw*, 4.

⁴¹ *People v. Friede* (Magistrates' Court, City of New York, Borough of Manhattan, Seventh District February 21, 1929).

its depiction of homosexual relationships, thereby exemplifying the extent of societal condemnation and the efforts to erase homosexual visibility and acceptance.⁴² The post-war era brought about more aggressive legislative actions, such as the 1947 *Sex Perversion Elimination Program* by the U.S. Park Police, which employed intimidation tactics and arrests targeted at gay men. In 1948, the enactment of a law for the treatment of “sexual psychopaths” highlighted a pejorative shift towards viewing homosexual behavior not only as criminal but also as a mental illness, leading to both legal and societal ramifications for those expressing same-sex desire.⁴³ Parallel to this legal persecution, the photographic representations captured in *Loving* reveal a contrasting narrative. These images, often close-up portraits, prioritize subject’s emotional connection and physical proximity, establishing an intimate communication between the subjects and the viewer. The consistent use of a frontal perspective across the collection not only addresses the technological limitations of the time but serves as a deliberate choice to foster empathy and understanding, challenging prevailing societal norms through direct engagement with the viewer. Despite the legal ramifications these early portraits suggest a presence of photographers willing to document and immortalize these intimate moments suggests a degree of acceptance and support within certain artistic circles, as discussed in the book *Art and Homosexuality*.⁴⁴ For instance, in images like *Davis & C. J.* (see photo X), the subjects’ direct gaze confronts societal prejudices, inviting recognition and acknowledgment of their humanity. This visual strategy articulates a desire for visibility, recognition, and ultimately acceptance, within a society that legally and socially marginalized same-sex relationships. Through the legal oppression and the intimate portraiture of gay men, *Loving* unveils the resilience of the human spirit. The collection transcends mere archival significance, embodying a profound act of resistance against the multifaceted layers of societal and legal exclusion. It illuminates the complexities of navigating public and private identities, offering a historical perspective on the evolving struggle for acceptance and the enduring quest for love and companionship in the face of adversity.

3.4 Masculinity and the double life

Understanding the social disapproval faced by homosexual men from 1850 to 1950 requires a deep dive into the societal norms and expectations of masculinity during this transformative

⁴² *People v. Friede*.

⁴³ Judith Adkins, “These People Are Frightened to Death,” Archive, National Archives, August 15, 2016, <https://www.archives.gov/publications/prologue/2016/summer/lavender.html>.

⁴⁴ Christopher Reed, *Art and Homosexuality: A History of Ideas* (Oxford University Press, 2011), 1, <https://global.oup.com/academic/product/art-and-homosexuality-9780195399073?cc=gb&lang=en&>.

period in American history. As this thesis explores, the industrial revolution and the rise of the breadwinner model significantly reshaped the socio-economic landscape.⁴⁵ This revolution not only redefined the concept of work and family but also established rigid standards for masculine success, primarily around the ability to provide financially for a family. This societal framework inherently expected conformity to heterosexual norms, including marriage and procreation, positioning these as benchmarks of a successful and socially acceptable masculinity. Consequently, deviations from these established norms were not merely frowned upon but were often met with harsh societal censure, leaving homosexual men particularly stigmatized for their failure to embody the era's idealized masculine image.⁴⁶

This period witnessed the emergence of what is often referred to as the "double life" for many homosexual men, a term that encapsulates the strenuous effort to conceal one's true identity while performing heteronormative roles in public to sidestep discrimination and social marginalization.⁴⁷ The visual anthology *Loving* provides a poignant counter-narrative through its rich collection of images that defiantly celebrate homosexual love while subtly challenging the prescribed norm of masculinity of their times.⁴⁸ Images like the *Men's pregnancy photo* (see photo XI) play with traditional gender roles and expectations, portraying two men in an arrangement reminiscent of maternity photographs, a direct subversion of the heteronormative family model. Similarly, *Trainworkers* (see photo XII) captures men in a traditionally masculine setting of manual labor, yet their tender embrace on the train tracks boldly contradicts the expected stoicism of their profession. This bravery of showing affection in such a public and traditionally masculine environment hints at the underlying courage required to defy societal expectations. However, not all occupational environments were as accepting of non-conformity. The military, for instance, historically a bastion of hypermasculine ideals, exhibited significant resistance to the inclusion of homosexual men. This resistance was codified in legal and administrative measures, such as the revision of *The Articles of War* to punish any "assault with intent to commit sodomy," a policy aiming to stigmatize and penalize homosexual acts among servicemen.⁴⁹ Moreover, by the mid-1900s, prevailing psychological assessments within the military deemed homosexual servicemembers as unfit for service, citing risks to unit

⁴⁵ Michael S. Kimmel and Amy Aronson, eds., *Men and Masculinities: A Social, Cultural, and Historical Encyclopedia* (Santa Barbara, Calif: ABC-CLIO, 2004).

⁴⁶ ESKRIDGE and Eskridge, *Gaylaw*, 3.

⁴⁷ Chauncey, *Gay New York*, 273.

⁴⁸ Chauncey, 273.

⁴⁹ Naval Institute Staff, "Key Dates in U. S. Military LGBT Policy," *U.S. Naval Institute* (blog), March 26, 2018, <https://www.usni.org/naval-history-blog-collection/key-dates-u-s-military-lgbt-policy>.

cohesion.⁵⁰ These attitudes underscore the broader societal efforts to regulate masculinity and demonize homosexual relationships, as depicted in J.C. Leyendecker's *Soldier's Pride* (see Ill. I), where the stoic, rugged soldier emblemizes the military man's traditional masculine ideal. Contrasting this, *Loving* includes *Laying Side by Side* (see photo XII), a photo of two men in military uniform displaying a level of intimacy and vulnerability that directly challenges such stereotypes. Navigating the complexities between public heteronormative facades and private homosexual identities often resulted in significant psychological strife for many men.⁵¹ The constant oscillation between conflicting identities could induce cognitive dissonance, a state of mental discomfort arising from holding two contradictory beliefs simultaneously.⁵² This phenomenon was not just theoretical; it represented a daily reality for homosexual men attempting to reconcile their sense of self with societal expectations. Despite this inner turmoil, the concept of leading a double life was not uniformly burdensome. For some, it was a pragmatic choice, a means of navigating a hostile social landscape while safeguarding personal safety and maintaining social standing. Joel Honing's reflection in *Gay New York: Gender, Urban Culture, and the Making of the Gay Male World, 1890-1940* captures this sentiment by illustrating how homosexual activities were compartmentalized as weekend pursuits for some men, a segment of their identity rather than its entirety.⁵³ This perspective indicates a range of responses to the pressures of societal conformity, from viewing homosexuality as a discreet activity to a defining aspect of one's identity.⁵⁴ The varying responses to the need for a double life underscore the multifaceted nature of identity and the complexities of living under societal scrutiny. While some men found this duplicity to be a heavy psychological burden, leading to emotional isolation and strained self-relationships, others perceived it as a necessary strategy for self-preservation. For this latter group, homosexuality was just one facet of their broader identity, not defining their self-perception but instead one part of a complex mosaic of roles including son, brother, uncle, employee, and leader.

Through an analysis of masculine imagery and its implications for men in love during the period from 1850 to 1950, this thesis sheds light on the intricate dynamics between societal expectations, personal identity, and the pursuit of authenticity. The exploration of the "double

⁵⁰ Jubilee Marshall, "Background Essay on the LGBTQ+ Community and the Military · SHEC: Resources for Teachers," *American Social History Project/Center for Media and Learning*, accessed May 13, 2024, <https://shcp.ashp.cuny.edu/items/show/2642>.

⁵¹ Chauncey, *Gay New York*, 273.

⁵² Chauncey, 273.

⁵³ Chauncey, 274.

⁵⁴ Chauncey, 273.

life" phenomenon reveals not only a survival mechanism but also the profound psychological challenges of navigating societal strictures. This period of history, marked by both overt marginalization and subtle forms of resistance, highlights the enduring struggle of homosexual men to forge spaces of safety and acceptance amidst prevailing discrimination. Thus, this thesis argues for a nuanced understanding of the historical experiences of homosexual men, acknowledging the varied strategies they employed to navigate the choppy waters of societal approval and disapproval, and the significant impact this had on their personal and public lives.

3.5 Telling those who know - the hidden language among men

In the historical span from 1850 to 1950, the societal landscape for homosexual individuals was fraught with both overt discrimination and subtler forms of social marginalization. This environment necessitated the cultivation of a "double life" for many, a phenomenon characterized by the need for secrecy in one's personal identity contradicting with the public facade of conforming to the heteronormative standards of the time. Within this context, the role of hidden languages or symbolic communication systems became paramount, serving as lifelines for those seeking connection and community amidst the pervasive climate of exclusion. This analysis aims to uncover the utilization and significance of such hidden languages among gay men in love during this era, leveraging the rich visual narratives presented in historical images.

The foundation of this secretive communication lies in the necessity to navigate an existence where one's true self must constantly be guarded. This dual existence often led to profound feelings of isolation, as the reconciliation between societal expectations and authentic identity became a daily struggle. The development of hidden cues, therefore, was not merely a strategy for social engagement but a crucial lifeline that facilitated the survival of a stigmatized identity within an oppressive society. The hidden language among homosexual men during this period manifested in a multitude of forms, ranging from the use of certain accessories to the adoption of particular gestures. A notable example within the broader popular culture emerged in the form of the *Gay ear*, a term from the 1970s, referring to the ear in which a man chose to wear an earring as a subtle indicator of his sexual orientation, predicated on the mantra "Left is right and right is wrong."⁵⁵ Although this practice postdates the period under consideration, it exemplifies the continuation and evolution of symbolic communication used by homosexual

⁵⁵ Lynn Loheide and Margo Dellaquilla, "Point 89: The Gay Ear | The Point," Journal, *The Point Journal of Body Piercing* (blog), August 7, 2020, <https://thepointjournal.org/2020/08/07/the-gay-ear/>.

men to navigate societal interactions discreetly. The authors of the book shed light on this phenomenon of hidden language starting from the mid-1800s to the 1920s, noting that two men posing under a single umbrella could be interpreted as an outward declaration of love and companionship.⁵⁶ This observation speaks to the ingenuity and resilience of homosexual individuals in coding their identities and relationships within the public eye, transforming everyday objects into symbols of romantic connection and solidarity. Illustrations by artists such as J.C. Leyendecker further corroborate the existence and use of hidden language within the homosexual communities. Leyendecker's art, celebrated for its sleek and stylized portrayals of masculinity, resonated with both heterosexual and homosexual audiences.⁵⁷ His works, while not overtly signaling homosexual identities, offered a medium through which gay men could find validation and a sense of belonging. *The Dorchester – the Cluett Dress Shirt* (see Ill. 2) one of Leyendecker's acclaimed illustrations, subtly conveys intimacy and romantic affection between the two men depicted, absent of traditional markers like wedding rings, suggesting a narrative beyond platonic friendship. While Leyendecker's illustrations may not have been explicitly intended as symbols of homosexual identity, they nonetheless provided a means for homosexual individuals to identify with and derive a sense of belonging from his artistic depictions. The duality of Leyendecker's appeal, heterosexual men aspiring to the wealth and class depicted while homosexual men identified with the undercurrents of same-sex desire, highlights the complex navigation of societal expectations and identity formation in this period. This nuanced relation between visibility and concealment is further mirrored in the treatment of female figures within such artworks and photographs. Like in *Eugenie von Klenze* (see photo XIII) the woman is lying topless on a bed, most likely for the amusement of the male onlooker. In the pictures in *Loving* the women are often relegated to the background or entirely omitted, shifting the viewer's focus to the intimate bonds between men.

An examination of *Group Photo in the Woods* (see photo XIV) reveals similar thematic elements, where the presence of male couples becomes the focal point, overshadowing the peripheral placement of women within the scene. Such photographic and illustrative choices underscore the hidden language of homosexual love and companionship, utilizing visual codes to foreground same-sex relationships while navigating the constraints of societal norms. The dual desire for the same idealized lifestyle, although for different reasons, among both

⁵⁶ Swann, Nini, and Treadwell, "Perspective | Never before Published Images of Men in Love between 1850 and 1950."

⁵⁷ Norman Rockwell Museum, "J.C. Leyendecker," Museum, Illustration History, accessed April 19, 2024, <https://www.illustrationhistory.org/artists/jc-leyendecker>.

heterosexual and homosexual audiences underline the complexity of navigating societal expectations and identity formation during this period. Leyendecker's illustrations served as a form of secret communication, enabling homosexual individuals to express their true selves discreetly while simultaneously conforming to societal norms and expectations in a public setting. In this way, the use of hidden language facilitated the maintenance of the double life among homosexual individuals, allowing them to navigate the complexities of identity and social interaction within a hostile social environment.

Moreover, the incorporation of symbolic elements like the spoon in *Happy couple on a bench* (see photo XV) enriches the hidden language by offering subtle yet profound indicators of romantic affiliation. These icons and symbols are strategically deployed to communicate complex emotions and experiences, offering viewers a deeper understanding of the hidden narratives embedded within the image. A coded communication hidden from the uninformed eye but a clear declaration for those who knew their significance. The concealed spoon serves as a symbol of romantic affection, referencing cultural associations with the term spoon. Havelock Ellis published his book *Studies in the Psychology of Sex, Volume 2*⁵⁸ in 1900 where he writes about both male and female homosexuality. In this book he mentions that as far as he has been able to find out the homosexual unions between women had own local names like spoon.⁵⁹ Looking closer at the photo *Happy couple on a bench* (see photo XVI) we see the adaption of the symbolic use of spoon when talking about homosexual men. Showing how the metaphorical use of the spoon conveys a message of love and unity between the men depicted, bypassing the need for explicit displays of affection in public forums. Through an observation of these visual and symbolic cues, we uncover the multi-layered strategies employed by gay men to express and document their romantic experiences within a restrictive societal framework. Thus, each image, enriched with hidden languages and symbols, unfolds a narrative of courage, yearning, and resilience. This not only illuminates the ingenious ways in which homosexual men navigated identity and belonging but also provides insight into the intricate web of social interactions and emotional landscapes during a time of significant societal constraints. Through this exploration, we gain a deeper understanding of the historical backdrop against which these men loved, struggled, and ultimately forged a sense of community through shared languages of secrecy and symbolism.

⁵⁸ Ellis Havelock, *Studies In The Psychology Of Sex Vol. II Havelock Ellis* (The University Press, 1900), <http://archive.org/details/StudiesInThePsychologyOfSexVol.IIHavelockEllis>.

⁵⁹ Havelock.

4 Conclusion

The exploration of *Loving: A Photographic History of Men in Love 1850s-1950s* within the context of this thesis has illuminated the hidden narratives of homosexual relationships spanning a century of American history. Through a meticulous examination of visual culture, legal frameworks, and societal attitudes, this research has underlined the complex relation between visibility and concealment that characterized the lived experiences of homosexual men during the period from 1850 to 1950. These photographs, once cloaked in secrecy but now revealed, serve not only as intimate glimpses into the past but as profound statements on the enduring nature of love, identity, and resilience. This thesis has demonstrated how the visual representation of male same-sex love, encapsulated within the pages of *Loving*, reflects and counters prevailing legal and societal narratives about homosexuality. By doing so, it contributes a critical analysis to the broader academic discourse on LGBTQ+ history and visual culture, identifying both the challenges and triumphs faced by homosexual men in asserting their identity and relationships against a backdrop of legal prohibition and social ostracism. Notably, the photographic collection acts as a bridge connecting personal, often hidden stories of affection with the public sphere, challenging viewers to reassess historical attitudes towards homosexuality and to recognize the inherent humanity within these deeply personal relationships. In delving into legal and societal contexts, this work has highlighted the measures employed to regulate homosexuality and the pervasive stigmatization that forced these relationships into the shadows. Despite this, *Loving* reveals moments of joy, intimacy, and defiance, serving as a testament to the capacity of human beings to find and celebrate love, even in the most oppressive conditions. The collection, thus, not only documents hidden histories but also embodies an act of resistance, preserving the memory of those who dared to love in defiance of societal norms. This analysis further underlines the pivotal role of photography as a means of cultural expression and historical documentation. In capturing moments of affection and partnership, these photographs not only challenge contemporary society's perception of homosexuality but also contribute to our understanding of how visual representations can mirror, contest, and transcend legal and social norms. By revealing the nuanced and often complex realities of homosexual men during this era, the collection serves as a powerful reminder of the capacity of visual culture to influence societal perceptions and to instigate social change.

In conclusion, this thesis asserts that the representation of homosexual relationships in *Loving* significantly contributes to our understanding of the multifaceted nature of sexuality, identity,

and societal norms from 1850 to 1950. This thesis enriches our collective understanding of the human condition through its exploration of love, loss, and longing. As such, this work stands as a contribution to the fields of LGBTQ+ studies, visual culture, and social history, offering a lens through which future scholars can continue to explore the intricate dance between visibility and invisibility that characterizes the queer experience. Ultimately, this thesis serves as a reminder of the power of photography to bear witness, to challenge, and to celebrate the diversity of human love. In doing so, it encourages a continued examination and appreciation of the complex narratives that shape our shared history, highlighting the importance of love as a universal experience that transcends the limits of time, culture, and law.

5 Photographs and illustrations



Photograph I Carleton E. Watkins. Piwyac, Vernal Fall, 300 feet, Yosemite. 1861. Albumen print. The Art of Perception. Exh. cat. San Francisco Museum of Modern Art; The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York; National Gallery of Art, Washington, 1999-2000: no. 12. <https://www.nga.gov/collection/art-object-page.92228.html#bibliography>

Photograph II Unknown. Arbitrary title: Two Men Getting Married. Undated. Postcard. Hugh Nini and Neal Treadwell. Loving: a photographic history of men in love 1850s-1950s page 312 – 313. <https://www.loving1000.org/>



Photograph III Unknown. Arbitrary title: Not Married But Wiling To Be. Undateted. Photo strip. Hugh Nini and Neal Treadwell. Loving: a photographic history of men in love 1850s-1950s page 89. <https://www.loving1000.org/>

Photograph IV Unknown. Arbitrary title: Under the umbrella. Undated. Photo strip. Hugh Nini and Neal Treadwell. Loving: a photographic history of men in love 1850s-1950s page 88. <https://www.loving1000.org/>



Photograph V Unknown. Arbitrary title: Honeymoon cart in Reno. Aproxamatly 1910. Postcard. Hugh Nini and Neal Treadwell. Loving: a photographic history of men in love 1850s-1950s page 67. <https://www.loving1000.org/>



Photograph VI Unknown. Arbitrary title: Two Men and Two Women Looking at Photographs. Undated. Photograph. Hugh Nini and Neal Treadwell. Loving: a photographic history of men in love 1850s-1950s page 298. <https://www.loving1000.org/>





Photograph VII Unknown. Arbitrary title: Lovers in a studio. Aproxamatly 1860. Tintype. Hugh Nini and Neal Treadwell. Loving: a photographic history of men in love 1850s-1950s page 32. <https://www.loving1000.org/>

Photograph VIII Unknown. Arbitrary title: Two Men and a Car. Årstall. Medium. Hugh Nini and Neal Treadwell. Loving: a photographic history of men in love 1850s-1950s page 256-257. <https://www.loving1000.org/>



Photograph IX Unknown. Arbitrary title: Edward and his chum. Undated. Photograph. Hugh Nini and Neal Treadwell. Loving: a photographic history of men in love 1850s-1950s page 209. <https://www.loving1000.org/>



Photograph X Unknown. Arbitrary title: Davis and & C.J. 1951.
Photograph. Hugh Nini and Neal Treadwell. Loving: a photographic history of men in love 1850s-1950s page 108.
<https://www.loving1000.org/>



Photograph XI Unknown. Arbitrary title: Men's pregnancy photo. 1952.
Photograph. Hugh Nini and Neal Treadwell. Loving: a photographic history of men in love 1850s-1950s page 263.
<https://www.loving1000.org/>



Photograph XII Unknown. Arbitrary title: Trainworkers. Undated.
Photograph. Hugh Nini and Neal Treadwell. Loving: a photographic history of men in love 1850s-1950s page 125. <https://www.loving1000.org/>

Illustration I Leyendecker, Joseph Christian "J.C.". Soldier's Pride, House of Kuppenheimer advertisement. 1916-1917. Oil on canvas. LOT NO. 4284. <https://www.illustratedgallery.com/artwork/original/4284/by-joseph-christian-leyendecker/>



Photograph XIII Unknown. Arbitrary title: Laying Side by Side. 1945. Photograph. Hugh Nini and Neal Treadwell. Loving: a photographic history of men in love 1850s-1950s page 110.1. <https://www.loving1000.org/>

Illustration II Leyendecker, Joseph Christian "J.C.". The Dorchester – the Cluett Dress Shirt. 1911. Oil on canvas. Inventarnummer. National Museum of American Illustration, Newport, RI. <https://artblart.com/2023/08/05/exhibition-under-cover-j-c-leyendecker-and-american-masculinity-at-the-new-york-historical-society/>





Photograp XIV Hanfstaengl, Franz. Studie van Eugenie von Klenze. 1854.
Photograph. Unknown owner.
<https://www.costumecocktail.com/2015/09/03/eugenie-von-klenze-1854/>



Photograph XV Unknown. Arbitrary title: Group Photo in the Woods. Undated. Cabinet card. Hugh Nini and Neal Treadwell. Loving: a photographic history of men in love 1850s-1950s page 316-317.
<https://www.loving1000.org/>



Photograph XVI Unknown. Arbitrary title: Happy couple on a bench. Aproxamatly 1910. Postcard. Hugh Nini and Neal Treadwell. Loving: a photographic history of men in love 1850s-1950s page 58.
<https://www.loving1000.org/>

6 Literature

- Adkins, Judith. "“These People Are Frightened to Death.”" Archive. National Archives, August 15, 2016.
<https://www.archives.gov/publications/prologue/2016/summer/lavender.html>.
- Amnesty International. "URGENT ACTION MAN SENTENCED FOR HOMOSEXUALITY." Amnesty International, November 12, 2010. <https://www.amnesty.org/fr/wp-content/uploads/2021/07/mde230132010en.pdf>.
- Armstrong, Carol. "Automatism and Agency Intertwined: A Spectrum of Photographic Intentionality." *Critical Inquiry* 38, no. 4 (June 2012): 705–26.
<https://doi.org/10.1086/667421>.
- Barthes, Roland, and Roland Barthes. *Camera Lucida: Reflections on Photography*. 2. impr. Flamingo Edition. London: Fontana Paperbacks, 1988.
- Belting, Hans, Thomas Dunlap, and Hans Belting. *An Anthropology of Images: Picture, Medium, Body*. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 2011.
- Benshoff, Harry M., and Sean Griffin. *Queer Images: A History of Gay and Lesbian Film in America*. Genre and Beyond. Lanham, Md: Rowman & Littlefield Pub, 2006.
- Carotti, Elena. *Loving: A Photographic History of Men in Love 1850s-1950s Nini-Treadwell Collection*. Milan: 5 continents, 2020.
- Chauncey, George. *5. Gay New York: Gender, Urban Culture, and the Making of the Gay Male World, 1890-1940*. Reprint edition. New York: Basic Books, 1995.
<https://catalog.princeton.edu/catalog/SCSB-3142342>.
- D’Emilio, John, and Estelle B. Freedman. *Intimate Matters: A History of Sexuality in America*. Third edition. Chicago London: The University of Chicago Press, 2012.
- ESKRIDGE, William N., and William N. Eskridge. *Gaylaw: Challenging the Apartheid of the Closet*. Harvard University Press, 2009. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/j.ctvjz82vn>.
- Gardiner, Michael, Gunalan Nadarajan, and Catherine Soussoff. *The Handbook of Visual Culture*. Edited by Ian Heywood and Barry Sandywell. 1st ed. Bloomsbury Publishing Plc, 2012. <https://doi.org/10.5040/9781474294140>.
- Guillen, Lina. "Marriage Rights and Benefits." In *Nolo*. Accessed May 7, 2024.
<https://www.nolo.com/legal-encyclopedia/marriage-rights-benefits-30190.html>.
- Havelock, Ellis. *Studies In The Psychology Of Sex Vol. II Havelock Ellis*. The University Press, 1900. <http://archive.org/details/StudiesInThePsychologyOfSexVol.IIHavelockEllis>.
- Katz, Jonathan. *Gay American History: Lesbians and Gay Men in the U.S.A. : A Documentary History*. Avon Books, 1976.
<https://archive.org/details/gayamericanhisto00katz/page/n5/mode/1up>.
- Kimmel, Michael S., and Amy Aronson, eds. *Men and Masculinities: A Social, Cultural, and Historical Encyclopedia*. Santa Barbara, Calif: ABC-CLIO, 2004.
- Kraus, Kelly. "Queer Theology: Reclaiming Christianity for the LGBT Community." *E-Research: A Journal of Undergraduate Work* 2, no. 3 (2014).
<https://digitalcommons.chapman.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1055&context=e-Research>.
- Lewis, Steven L. "Gay Masquerade: Male Homosexuals in American Cities, 1910 to 1940." Master Theses, Western Michigan University, 1988.
https://scholarworks.wmich.edu/masters_theses/1139?utm_source=scholarworks.wmich.edu%2Fmasters_theses%2F1139&utm_medium=PDF&utm_campaign=PDFCoverPages.

- Loheide, Lynn, and Margo Dellaquilla. "Point 89: The Gay Ear | The Point." Journal. *The Point Journal of Body Piercing* (blog), August 7, 2020. <https://thepointjournal.org/2020/08/07/the-gay-ear/>.
- Marshall, Jubilee. "Background Essay on the LGBTQ+ Community and the Military · SHEC: Resources for Teachers." *American Social History Project/Center for Media and Learning*. Accessed May 13, 2024. <https://shec.ashp.cuny.edu/items/show/2642>.
- Marziali, Megan E., Heather L. Armstrong, Kalysha Closson, Taylor McLinden, Lu Wang, Justin Barath, Marianne Harris, et al. "Loneliness and Self-Rated Physical Health Among Gay, Bisexual and Other Men Who Have Sex with Men in Vancouver, Canada." *Journal of Epidemiology and Community Health* 74, no. 7 (June 2020): 553–59. <https://doi.org/10.1136/jech-2019-213566>.
- National Gallery of Art. "The Nineteenth Century: The Invention of Photography." Gallery. Accessed May 1, 2024. <https://www.nga.gov/features/in-light-of-the-past/the-19th-century-the-invention-of-photography.html>.
- Naval Institute Staff. "Key Dates in U. S. Military LGBT Policy." *U.S. Naval Institute* (blog), March 26, 2018. <https://www.usni.org/naval-history-blog-collection/key-dates-u-s-military-lgbt-policy>.
- Norman Rockwell Museum. "J.C. Leyendecker." Museum. Illustration History. Accessed April 19, 2024. <https://www.illustrationhistory.org/artists/jc-leyendecker>.
- Parker, Lewis R., ed. "The Penal Code of the State of New York, Being Chapter 676 of the Laws of 1881, as Amended by the Laws of 1882-1900." The Banks Law Publishing Company, January 2, 1912. <https://hdl.handle.net/2027/hvd.hl46ui?urlappend=%3Bseq=7>.
- People v. Friede (Magistrates' Court, City of New York, Borough of Manhattan, Seventh District February 21, 1929).
- Perry, Douglas. "The Civil War as Photographed by Mathew Brady." Archive. National Archives, August 15, 2016. <https://www.archives.gov/education/lessons/brady-photos>.
- Pickett, Brent. "Homosexuality." In *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, edited by Edward N. Zalta, Spring 2021. Metaphysics Research Lab, Stanford University, 2021. <https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/spr2021/entries/homosexuality/>.
- Reed, Christopher. *Art and Homosexuality: A History of Ideas*. Oxford University Press, 2011. <https://global.oup.com/academic/product/art-and-homosexuality-9780195399073?cc=gb&lang=en&>.
- Scott, Joan W. "The Evidence of Experience." *Critical Inquiry* 17, no. 4 (Summer 1991): 773–97.
- Smalls, James. *Homosexuality in Art*. Temporis Collection. New York: Parkstone, 2003. <http://www.parkstone-international.com/detail/9/homosexuality-in-art/2#sthash.FVAmvrLw.dpbs>.
- Swann, Dee, Hugh Nini, and Neal Treadwell. "Perspective | Never before Published Images of Men in Love between 1850 and 1950." *Washington Post*, September 28, 2020. <https://www.washingtonpost.com/photography/2020/09/28/loving-a-photographic-history-of-men-in-love/>.
- Thaddeus, Morgan. "When Hollywood Studios Married Off Gay Stars to Keep Their Sexuality a Secret." *HISTORY*, July 26, 2023. <https://www.history.com/news/hollywood-lmarriages-gay-stars-lgbt>.

- The Virginia Department of Historic Resources. "Timeline of LGBT History in Virginia and the United States." The Virginia Department of Historic Resources, July 2021. https://www.dhr.virginia.gov/wp-content/uploads/2021/07/LGBTQ_Timeline-Virginia-and-US.pdf.
- TheFreeDictionary. "Lavender Marriage." Accessed May 7, 2024. <https://medical-dictionary.thefreedictionary.com/lavender+marriage>.
- Tisdale, Ellen, Rachel Baron Singer, Amanda Seppala, Michell Geysbeek, and Jay Purrazzo. "In Focus: The Evolution of the Personal Camera." Digital Public Library of America, July 2015. <https://dp.la/exhibitions/evolution-personal-camera/early-photography>.
- Weinmeyer, Richard. "The Decriminalization of Sodomy in the United States." *AMA Journal of Ethics* 16, no. 11 (November 1, 2014): 916–22. <https://doi.org/10.1001/virtualmentor.2014.16.11.hlaw1-1411>.